COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS PENSION RESERVES INVESTMENT MANAGEMENT BOARD

Minutes of the Board Meeting
Thursday, February 16, 2023
commencing at 9:30 a.m.

(CONDUCTED REMOTELY)

PRIM Board Offices 84 State Street Boston, Massachusetts

ATTENDEES

(Via Zoom)

Board Members

- · Treasurer Deborah B. Goldberg, Chair
- · Robert L. Brousseau
- · Ruth Ellen Fitch
- · Theresa F. McGoldrick, Esq.
- · Peter Monaco
- · Dennis J. Naughton
- · Carly Rose

Other Attendees (partial list):

- · Andre Abouhala
- · Francesco Daniele
- · Tim Doyle
- · Shannon Ericson
- · Anthony Falzone
- · Alyssa Fiore
- · David Griswold
- · Helen Huang
- Emily Kowtoniuk
- · Chuck LaPosta
- · Renee LeFevre
- · Jay Leu
- · Bill Li
- · Michael McElroy
- · Michael McGirr
- · Tim Schlitzer
- · Valerie Sullivan
- · Michael Trotsky

ı	PRUCEEDINGS
2	A meeting of the Pension Reserves
3	Investment Management Board (PRIM Board) was held
4	remotely on February 16, 2023. The meeting was
5	called to order and convened at 9:30 a.m.
6	Treasurer and Receiver-General Deborah Goldberg
7	chaired the meeting.
8	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Good morning,
9	everybody. I am going to proceed to read our
10	scripts to kick off the meeting, and then today is
11	a special day because I am swearing in Ruth Ellen
12	Fitch as a board member for MassPRIM for her third
13	term, which coincides with somebody else's third
14	term. No one I can think of off the top of my
15	head.
16	But I'll actually share that a pass code
17	I have for one of my devices is actually "third
18	term." I was trying to think of they said,
19	"Think of a new pass code."
20	I said, "Third term."
21	MS. FITCH: Right. There you go.
22	TREASURER GOLDBERG: We'll have to
23	change that in four years.
24	This meeting will be held in accordance

- 1 with the provisions of Massachusetts Chapter 22 of
- the Acts of 2022, which was signed into law on
- February 15, 2022, and most recently amended on
- 4 July 16, 2022, that includes an extension until
- 5 March 31, 2023, of the remote meeting provisions
- of the March 12, 2020 Executive Order Suspending
- 7 Certain Provisions of the Open Meeting Law.
- 8 All members of the board will
- 9 participate remotely via audio/videoconferencing,
- and public access to the deliberations of the
- 11 board will likewise be provided via telephone with
- all documents referenced at the meeting available
- to be viewed on PRIM's website,
- www.mapension.com.
- 15 All persons speaking at today's meeting
- are asked first to identify themselves. Also the
- 17 Open Meeting Law requires anyone wishing to record
- a meeting to first notify the chair so that the
- 19 chair can inform the other attendees.
- Accordingly, I am informing all of you
- 21 that stenographer Virginia Dodge from Lexitas is
- transcribing and also recording this meeting.
- 23 If anyone else does intend to record
- today's meeting, please first notify Seth Gitell

- 1 by email at sgitell@mapension.com.
- 2 Additionally, the Attorney General's
- 3 guidance on holding remote meetings reads as
- 4 follows: At the start of the meeting, the chair
- 5 must announce the name of the member or members
- 6 who are participating remotely.
- 7 I will now announce the names of all
- 8 PRIM Board members who are participating remotely
- 9 in today's meeting: myself, Treasurer Deb
- 10 Goldberg, Bob Brousseau, Ruth Ellen Fitch, Theresa
- 11 McGoldrick, Peter Monaco, Dennis Naughton and
- 12 Carly Rose, who I see is here, which I'm very
- 13 pleased because, Carly, you're here in time for
- 14 Ruth Ellen Fitch's swearing in.
- 15 So with that, Ruth Ellen --
- MS. ROSE: Wonderful.
- 17 TREASURER GOLDBERG: -- I'm very
- 18 excited. Raise your right hand, and I will
- 19 proceed with the oath of office.
- 20 So say "I" and state your name.
- 21 MS. FITCH: I, Ruth Ellen Fitch.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Do solemnly swear.
- MS. FITCH: Do solemnly swear.
- 24 TREASURER GOLDBERG: That I will bear

- 1 true faith.
- 2 MS. FITCH: That I will bear true faith.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: And allegiance.
- 4 MS. FITCH: And allegiance.
- 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: To the Commonwealth
- 6 of Massachusetts and will support the constitution
- 7 thereof, so help me God.
- 8 MS. FITCH: To the Commonwealth of
- 9 Massachusetts and will support the constitution
- 10 thereof, so help me God.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I, state your name.
- MS. FITCH: I, Ruth Ellen Fitch.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Do solemnly swear
- and affirm that I will faithfully and impartially
- discharge and perform all the duties incumbent on
- me as a member of the Pension Reserves Investment
- 17 Management Board.
- MS. FITCH: Do solemnly swear and affirm
- that I will faithfully and impartially discharge
- and perform all the duties incumbent on me as a
- 21 member of the Pension Reserves Investment
- 22 Management Board.
- 23 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Better known as
- 24 PRIM. No that's not in the oath.

- 1 According to the best of my abilities.
- 2 MS. FITCH: According to the best of my
- 3 abilities.
- 4 TREASURER GOLDBERG: And understanding
- 5 agreeably to the rules and regulations of the
- 6 Constitution and the laws of this Commonwealth, so
- 7 help me God.
- 8 MS. FITCH: And understanding agreeably
- 9 to the rules and regulations of the Constitution
- and the laws of this Commonwealth, so help me God.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I, state your name.
- MS. FITCH: I, Ruth Ellen Fitch.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Do solemnly swear.
- MS. FITCH: Do solemnly swear.
- 15 TREASURER GOLDBERG: That I will support
- the Constitution of the United States.
- 17 MS. FITCH: That I will support the
- 18 Constitution of the United States.
- 19 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Congratulations.
- 20 MS. FITCH: Yay. I did it. I did it.
- Thank you, Deb.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Here's a hug.
- MS. FITCH: Okay. That too. Thank you.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. She's good,

- 1 everybody, for four more years.
- 2 MS. McGOLDRICK: Congratulations.
- MS. FITCH: That was cool. Thank you.
- 4 MR. FALZONE: Congratulations.
- 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Now, with that, now
- 6 we have a few other things to cover. I know not
- 7 as big a deal as swearing in. But we will begin
- 8 then with the consent agenda.
- 9 Tony or Michael, does anyone want to say
- anything, or should I just read the motion?
- 11 MR. FALZONE: You can read the motion if
- 12 you like, Treasurer, and then I can certainly talk
- about a couple items very, very quickly. We don't
- want to spend too much time on it.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Right Exactly.
- We have a very, very busy day so we're going to be
- 17 well-behaved.
- 18 Okay then. I would seek a motion that
- 19 the PRIM Board approve the following consent
- 20 agenda items as described in the expanded agenda:
- 21 number 1, approval of the minutes of December 1,
- 22 2022 PRIM Board meeting; number 2, acceptance of
- 23 the State Auditor's Examination Report for the
- 24 period July 1, 2019 to January 15, 2022; number 3,

- 1 approval of the issuance of a request for
- 2 proposals for investment performance reporting
- 3 services, and further to authorize the executive
- 4 director to take all actions necessary to
- 5 effectuate this vote.
- 6 Is there a motion?
- 7 MS. FITCH: So moved.
- 8 MR. NAUGHTON: Moved. Second.
- 9 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Is there a second?
- 10 MR. NAUGHTON: Second.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Any questions or
- 12 comments? Or any comments on your part, Tony?
- 13 Otherwise, I will proceed with the roll call vote.
- MR. FALZONE: If no one has any comments
- or questions, I'm good to move forward with the
- 16 vote.
- 17 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Comments and
- 18 questions of the board?
- Hearing none, Bob?
- MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen?
- MS. FITCH: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Theresa?
- 24 MS. McGOLDRICK: I was not present,

- 1 Madam Treasurer, so I'm not going to vote. I
- 2 abstain.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: You're allowed to,
- 4 and there are things that you were. You just
- 5 weren't present for the minutes.
- 6 MS. McGOLDRICK: Okay, okay. So I vote
- 7 then. Thank you.
- 8 TREASURER GOLDBERG: And even if you're
- 9 not, you're allowed to vote on that, by the way.
- 10 Renee can nod.
- 11 Thank you.
- See. Once in a while, my lawyer hat
- 13 comes in handy.
- 14 Peter?
- MR. MONACO: Yes.
- 16 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Dennis?
- 17 MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly?
- MS. ROSE: Yes.
- 20 TREASURER GOLDBERG: And the motion
- 21 carries.
- Next item on the agenda. Here we go.
- 23 Michael Trotsky.
- MR. TROTSKY: I always forget to unmute.

- 1 Thank you, Treasurer. Good morning,
- 2 everyone. Thanks for making the time to be with
- 3 us today.
- 4 And congratulations to you, Ruth Ellen,
- for another four years. We're delighted to work
- 6 with you, of course.
- 7 MS. FITCH: I'm delighted to be here.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 MR. TROTSKY: So, Paul Shanley, as you
- 10 noted, will not be joining us today as he recovers
- 11 from a recent illness. He was hospitalized, but
- now he's home recovering. And we wish him the
- very best for his speedy recovery.
- 14 Also, better news, Maria Garrahan will
- not be here, but for a good reason. She may
- 16 actually be listening, I'm not sure, but Maria
- 17 Garrahan, her baby came early. Last weekend, she
- welcomed baby Sophia to her family and of course
- 19 to the PRIM family.
- We congratulate Maria and Patrick for
- 21 their first child and the beginning of the next
- chapter of their lives.
- Today Jay Leu, our director of risk, was
- gracious enough to volunteer to present the asset

- 1 allocation recommendation today that was of course
- 2 fully vetted and presented by Maria at the
- 3 Investment Committee meeting just a couple weeks
- 4 ago.
- 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I thought you were
- 6 going to say Jay Leu has volunteered to go over
- 7 and help take care of the baby. And I was going
- 8 to say he doesn't have to do that.
- 9 MR. TROTSKY: He probably would.
- 10 So today, we are very pleased to report
- 11 a significant improvement in PRIT Fund
- performance. We're reporting the December 2022
- quarterly report, and of course that follows three
- 14 straight quarters of market declines.
- The PRIT Fund was up 4 percent in the
- 16 December quarter to cap a very difficult calendar
- 17 year, 2022. I'll get to performance detail later,
- but a reminder that last year at this meeting, we
- 19 really celebrated an extremely strong calendar
- year 2021. And December 2021 quarterly results
- 21 were also very strong, up 5.4 percent net in that
- 22 calendar 2021 quarter.
- And as a reminder, calendar year 2021
- with the fund up more than 20 percent was the

- 1 fourth largest return in PRIM's entire history.
- 2 And with an outperformance of 8 percent net of
- 3 fees, that was the strongest outperformance in the
- 4 entire history of PRIM. And boy, what a
- 5 difference a year makes, right?
- 6 MS. FITCH: Right.
- 7 MR. BROUSSEAU: "What a difference a
- 8 year makes."
- 9 TREASURER GOLDBERG: That is a song, you
- 10 know.
- 11 MR. TROTSKY: We should expect market
- drops and economic cycles to impact the PRIT Fund
- periodically, and calendar 2022, as you all are
- 14 well-aware, was one of those periods. Equity bond
- and bond indices were down globally. For example,
- domestic equities were down 18 percent in calendar
- 17 year 2022. Developed international equities were
- down 14 and a half percent, and emerging market
- 19 equities were down 20 percent, despite the bounce
- 20 back that I'll get to in a minute in the December
- 21 quarter.
- Normally, we would expect bonds to offer
- some protection from a selloff in equities, but
- even bonds were down last year. They were down

- 1 substantially, down 13 percent. So that puts a
- 2 60/40 mix of stocks and bonds down 16.2 percent
- 3 for the year. But the PRIT Fund did fare better.
- 4 It was down 11.2 percent net of fees.
- 5 We can't control market returns because
- 6 we don't control such things as geopolitical
- 7 events, slowing economic growth worldwide,
- 8 monetary policy responses, wars, viruses, supply
- 9 chain shortages or the behavior of other
- 10 investors.
- We are market takers, and the only thing
- that we really do control and can control is the
- design and composition of the PRIT Fund. And
- we've carefully engineered a diversified portfolio
- with components that will perform well in a
- 16 variety of market conditions. We are also laser
- 17 focused on controlling our costs.
- 18 Our history of strong performance in
- both strong markets like we had in calendar 2021,
- 20 but also in weak markets like we had last year,
- 21 this is an indication that our portfolio is well-
- 22 constructed in terms of risk, return and cost.
- Those are PRIM's philosophical three pillars of
- 24 investment. All investments must be evaluated and

- 1 all portfolios must be evaluated on three equal
- 2 pillars of investment: risk, return and cost.
- This year, our alternatives,
- 4 specifically hedge funds, private equity,
- 5 timberland and real estate, helped anchor the fund
- 6 in the very stormy environment that I just
- 7 described, an investment period when both public
- 8 equities and bonds were down significantly in all
- 9 markets around the globe.
- The silver lining, and there is one, is
- 11 that market downturns do create good buying
- opportunities. And the PRIM team was very busy
- during the year evaluating opportunities and
- deploying approximately \$5.7 billion in new
- 15 investments.
- The other piece of good news is that the
- 17 December quarter was strong and positive, breaking
- three consecutive quarters of negative returns.
- 19 And so far this year, the strength is continuing.
- 20 For the quarter so far, which includes all of
- 21 January and half of February now, equity markets
- are up between 6 and 10 percent globally, with
- 23 Europe and China leading the way. And bonds are
- 24 up approximately 2 percent. We certainly hope

- 1 these good trends continue.
- 2 Customary for this board cycle, we will
- 3 discuss asset allocation recommendations and our
- 4 annual plans. The annual plans, which I'll
- 5 briefly discuss in a moment, are largely
- 6 consistent with prior years, but this year, you
- 7 will find a new effort under each functional area
- 8 at PRIM to support the newly formed ESG committee.
- 9 We believe the ESG committee will build on the
- 10 important work we have been doing internally and
- 11 with our partners at the MIT Sloan School's
- 12 Aggregate Confusion Project, of which we were a
- founding member.
- We are excited to get started with that
- 15 new committee and have reached out to each of the
- 16 new committee members to schedule our customary on-
- 17 boarding briefings. We expect the ESG committee's
- 18 first meeting will occur at the next board cycle.
- Now, on asset allocation --
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Pardon me, Michael.
- 21 I just want to interrupt for a minute. And I'm
- sorry to interrupt, but I think it's appropriate
- with mentioning the ESG committee.
- I gave a speech, as you know, at the

- 1 Bond Buyer symposium two weeks ago. And I have
- 2 renamed ESG -- we won't vote on it -- to be common
- 3 sense investment practices for the long term.
- 4 And I put that in right there because
- 5 you and anyone else who's attending this meeting
- 6 has heard a lot of, quote/unquote, "misuse" of the
- 7 term. And one of the things I want to emphasize
- 8 is that the work that we've done with MIT is
- 9 helping us get rid of the confusion because there
- is so much confusion and misnaming of this work,
- when in fact it's what practical, common-sense
- businesspeople and investors -- and, by the way,
- the rating agencies -- have been doing for years.
- 14 We're just doing it to add another layer of
- analysis to what we are investing in at PRIM.
- And so I just thought I would add that
- 17 to help enhance your presentation. Thank you,
- 18 Michael, for your tolerance and accepting my
- 19 jumping in.
- 20 MR. TROTSKY: No problem. Thanks for
- 21 the clarification.
- MR. FALZONE: And, Michael, while you
- pause, if you don't mind, we just found out Ronan
- O'Brien from FIN News is recording as well. I

- 1 just want to make the board aware.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Oh, good. So I
- actually hope, Ronan, that you did hear my
- 4 comments because, as you know, Ronan, this has
- 5 become a big discussion lately. And so I am
- 6 really clear about what we are doing and why we're
- 7 doing it.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 MR. TROTSKY: Thank you for that
- 10 clarification, Treasurer.
- 11 The other main agenda item for today is
- 12 asset allocation. And on asset allocation, at its
- meeting, the Investment Committee approved our
- 14 multi-year effort to gradually increase our
- 15 allocation to private equity. We'll be talking
- 16 about that today. We've found that maintaining a
- 17 consistent pace of private equity commitments has
- been a key contributor to our long-term success
- 19 overall.
- We have observed throughout our history
- 21 that some of our highest-performing private equity
- vintage years originate during volatile times,
- just like this, when other investors in fact may
- 24 be cutting their commitments for a variety of

- 1 reasons. And we're seeing that.
- 2 Our private equity partners have the
- 3 proven ability to wait for valuations to become
- 4 attractive to deploy our capital. And this is a
- 5 winning strategy. And investors who can provide
- 6 capital in difficult environments like PRIM, when
- 7 valuations are cheapest, we benefit the most.
- 8 We have learned that 80 percent of our
- 9 peers are currently 4 to 6 percent above their
- 10 ranges for private equity. But at 17.7 percent of
- 11 the PRIT Fund assets, as we sit here today,
- 12 private equity at PRIM is within our range, and we
- have room to continue our commitment pace.
- 14 I've said it before, and I'll say it
- 15 again. This deserves some recognition. Michael
- 16 McGirr and the private equity team painstakingly
- model our commitment pacing each and every year.
- And the fact that we're still within our range
- when others are not is really testimony to the
- 20 robustness of PRIM's very disciplined annual
- 21 process. It's not easy.
- The Investment Committee approved
- recommending a 1 percent additional allocation to
- 24 private equity. This continues a multi-year trend

- 1 consistent with our asset allocation research 2 findings and will enable us extra headroom to 3 maintain our commitment pace. Jay Leu, as I 4 mentioned before, will discuss that later in the 5 agenda today. 6 But before providing more detail on 7 performance and markets, a quick organizational 8 update. Two new employees. 9 First, please join me in welcoming 10 Pengtuan Wu to PRIM. He joined our research team 11 in January as an investment officer reporting to 12 Maria Garrahan. He holds a master of science 13 degree in mathematical finance from Rutgers and 14 before coming to PRIM was a principal quantitative 15 developer at Fidelity Investments. And at 16 Fidelity, he led the development of the 17 centralized factor engine, in addition to many 18 other quantitative research initiatives. 19 We're also pleased to report that our 20 valued intern on the research team, Tianyi Shi, 21 became a full member of the team effective
- She joined PRIM as a research intern in May of 2022, and she has worked within multiple

February 6, reporting again to Maria Garrahan.

22

- 1 areas of research while finishing her degree at
- 2 Boston University. Most notably, Tianyi worked on
- 3 the venture capital portfolio construction tool,
- 4 and she actually contributed very significantly to
- 5 this year's asset allocation research.
- 6 In December, Tianyi graduated from BU
- 7 with a master of science degree in mathematical
- 8 finance and financial technology. She also has a
- 9 bachelor's degree in financial engineering, and
- 10 we're delighted that she chose PRIM to start her
- 11 very promising new career.
- 12 So welcome to both of you. We're very
- 13 excited to have you.
- 14 And by the way, Maria, congratulations
- 15 for two great hires.
- 16 Next, an update on the FUTURE
- 17 Initiative. We recently announced that PRIM
- deployed more than \$2.8 billion, 2.8 billion, to
- diverse managers in 2022, bringing now the total
- to more than \$9 billion. And PRIM also designated
- 21 more than 340 million to 15, 15, emerging-diverse
- 22 managers as part of that \$1 billion program, which
- is specifically designed to reduce barriers
- between the PRIT Fund and emerging-diverse

- 1 managers.
- This progress was reported to the state
- 3 legislature as a requirement of the investment
- 4 equity legislation, the legislation championed by
- 5 the Treasurer more than two years ago. And as
- 6 reported by *Pensions and Investments*, this puts
- 7 PRIM at the very top of the heap compared to other
- 8 pension funds. *Pensions and Investments* ranks
- 9 PRIM seventh in the nation in dollars at work with
- 10 diverse investment managers, and that is far above
- 11 our rank in size.
- 12 Also in December, PRIM received the
- 13 Commonwealth's Equity in Governance Award for its
- 14 efforts in this area, and several on staff and the
- 15 Treasurer, you were there also, to receive this
- 16 important award.
- 17 So thank you, everyone, for your work in
- 18 this area.
- 19 Turning back to PRIT Fund performance,
- 20 the December quarter was a huge relief. The
- 21 December quarter was positive after three
- consecutive down quarters. For example, the S&P
- in the December quarter, domestic stocks were up
- 7.6 percent. Developed international stocks were

- 1 up far more. They were up 17.3 percent. Emerging
- 2 market stocks up nearly 10 percent. Diversified
- 3 bonds up 2 percent. And that puts a 60/40 mix of
- 4 stocks and bonds for the December quarter up
- 5 6.6 percent. So very strong quarter.
- 6 For the calendar year 2023 to date, that
- 7 strength continues. And for a month and a half,
- 8 so far, through mid-February, the S&P is up
- 9 7.9 percent now. Developed international markets
- 10 are up 8.1 percent. Emerging markets are up
- 11 6.1 percent, and bonds are up 1.5 percent.
- 12 So really good news reversing the
- decline that we suffered through in calendar 2022.
- 14 But calendar '22, I have to remind you, was very,
- 15 very challenging.
- In calendar 2022, despite the very
- 17 strong results in December, the calendar year was
- 18 still down significantly. For example, the S&P
- 19 was down 18.1 percent. The developed
- 20 international markets were down 14 and a half
- 21 percent. Emerging markets were down more than
- 22 20 percent. Diversified bonds were down
- 23 13 percent. Long bonds were down almost
- 40 percent. So that puts a 60/40 mix for the

- 1 calendar year down 16.2 percent. Again, the PRIT
- 2 Fund fared far better. It was down 10.8 percent
- gross or 11.2 percent net.
- 4 Tony, the performance slide, please.
- 5 You'll see on this slide that the fund
- 6 balance at the end of the calendar year was
- 7 \$92 billion, essentially flat from the fiscal year
- 8 '22 year end.
- 9 Net outflows to pay benefits --
- 10 remember, we do pay benefits out of this pool of
- 11 assets -- typically between one and one and a half
- billion, but last year, outflows to pay benefits
- were 738 million.
- 14 Next slide. For the one-year period,
- again, down 10.8 percent gross or 11.2 percent
- 16 net. That equates to an investment loss of
- 17 \$11.6 billion net. The chart shows
- 18 underperformance in the 12-month period of
- 19 3.8 percent or 4.2 percent net.
- We discussed this in great deal at the
- 21 Investment Committee. There are a couple of
- 22 reasons for this that we believe we've experienced
- in the past and will catch up in the future.
- 24 The primary reason for the

- 1 underperformance was that the PE benchmark
- compares a one-year performance, so one-year
- actual private equity performance, to a seven-year
- 4 annualized, seven-year smooth benchmark. It's a
- 5 long-term asset class. So as you can imagine, the
- 6 seven-year number is still very positive, but the
- 7 one-year number was challenged.
- 8 Also the real estate benchmark is
- 9 lagged. And unlagged, we discussed at the Real
- 10 Estate Committee that there's a 13 percent swing
- in that number.
- So going forward, those things should
- 13 smooth out.
- 14 You can see that the 3-, 5- and 10-year
- numbers are strong and above benchmark.
- 16 Next slide. For the one year ended
- 17 December 31, on the left, you can see what had
- 18 good returns, and on the right, you can see what
- 19 was weaker. I will note that the timberland
- benchmark, just like real estate, is lagged, and
- 21 so that contributed there, but very strong
- 22 performance absolute for timber was a very welcome
- 23 result.
- Also in timber, we do get appraiser

- 1 rotations yearly. These properties are appraised.
- 2 And appraiser rotations means that we have a new
- 3 appraiser every year, and different groups are
- 4 appraising our property. That property sets best
- 5 practice, but it does create some noise, and that
- 6 was in fact one of the reasons.
- 7 And on the right, you can see that
- 8 global equities were the weakest, along with core
- 9 fixed income, as you would expect in a rising
- 10 interest rate environment.
- 11 Next slide, the one-year performance.
- 12 On the left, you can see what did well. Again,
- timberland and real estate, private debt was also
- 14 very strong. All other asset classes were down.
- 15 U.S., international, emerging market equities and
- of course long duration fixed income, which I
- 17 described earlier.
- 18 Next slide. For the quarter, this was
- 19 somewhat of a reversal. As I mentioned, the
- 20 December quarter was strong, and it kind of
- 21 reversed some of the trends that we saw during the
- 22 year. For example, international stocks were the
- 23 strongest in the December quarter. Alternatives
- lagged a bit. That was the exact opposite of what

- 1 happened in the year.
- 2 RPE lagged a little bit. Real estate
- 3 will be normalizing. We appraise about a quarter
- 4 of our real estate properties every quarter. So
- 5 this was reflected in that.
- 6 This caused the PRIT Fund to be up
- 7 4.1 percent during the quarter. You can see the
- 8 beige bar in the middle. And that is a good
- 9 result for the quarter.
- 10 And I'll end with the quilt chart, which
- 11 is my favorite. And you can see over a long
- 12 period of time what really drives the bus at PRIM,
- private equity, real estate, even timber through
- 14 all environments very strong.
- 15 And what I like about this chart is to
- point out that global equities are among the most
- 17 volatile asset class in terms of long-term
- 18 performance. Some years are great, and other
- 19 years, like we just went through, are down a lot.
- 20 And we expect that.
- 21 So you can take those down.
- And just a few comments on markets. We
- began pointing out a peak in bond yields and signs
- that inflation had begun to moderate two quarters

- 1 ago in the August cycle. And last quarter, in the
- 2 December board meeting, you may remember Connie
- 3 Everson, our resident economics and strategy
- 4 expert, asserted that these developments, again a
- 5 peak in bond yields and signs that inflation had
- 6 begun to moderate, that these developments created
- 7 a much better outlook for the equity markets.
- 8 And she was correct at the August cycle
- 9 and again in the December cycle. The equity
- 10 markets bottomed and are continuing to rise.
- 11 Interest rates have peaked in October. And the
- bond market has also begun to rise, as I pointed
- 13 out.
- And as we sit here today, the market
- appears to be beginning to discount the end of the
- 16 Federal Reserve's aggressive tightening policy,
- 17 perhaps even a reversal, as we talked about at the
- 18 Investment Committee, on the heels of data that
- 19 suggests a cooling of the economy and moderating
- 20 inflation.
- 21 At the Investment Committee meeting two
- weeks ago, Connie pointed to factors that still
- 23 support a positive environment for stocks.
- 24 Inflation, as she described, quote, "melting," for

- 1 example. She also said, and I'll quote, "If GDP
- 2 is slightly above or slightly below the zero line,
- 3 that is essentially the same and consistent with a
- 4 stock market bottom. An economic plunge in excess
- of what has been discounted already is another
- 6 matter," end of quote.
- 7 And now, as we sit here today, the
- 8 consensus of investors and economists is really
- 9 for a very mild recession.
- 10 Of course, the main risks going forward
- 11 are familiar. The risks are that inflation spikes
- again or remains too high. After all, there are
- 13 geopolitical situations that could disrupt the
- 14 supply chain again. Consumer and business
- spending, along with corporate earnings, could
- 16 weaken more than anticipated. That doesn't seem
- to be happening, by the way.
- 18 And unemployment or wages could spike.
- 19 Any of these conditions could result in an
- 20 economic slowdown that turns into a severe
- 21 recession. Again, we don't really see that right
- 22 now, but there are many moving pieces in the
- global economy and in the world's geopolitical
- situation. We don't control any of that, but we

- 1 do believe the PRIT Fund is well-constructed to
- 2 perform relatively well in any environment that
- 3 the future brings.
- 4 So I'll stop there. Those are my
- 5 comments on PRIT Fund performance, organization
- 6 and markets, and take any questions you might
- 7 have.
- 8 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Are there any
- 9 questions for Michael?
- 10 I'd like to also just reiterate
- 11 something that I said, and it really is the way in
- which we view the fund. At the *Bond Buyer*
- national outlook event, I said we are all here
- today to speculate on what's happening in the
- 15 future, how you're going to deal with it, what
- 16 your investments are going to look like, what
- 17 strategies. And I said, I am here to let you know
- that I am 100 percent certain that everything has
- 19 uncertainty.
- 20 And so that is why our strategy here at
- 21 PRIM is that we have our strategy, and we don't
- react to the markets. We continue on the path of
- our strategy because we look at things for the
- long run.

So it got a good chuckle. And then I 1 2 proceeded to for the next 18 minutes, since they 3 wanted me to speak for 20, to explain how you can 4 continue to perform and excel in a world of 5 uncertainty. 6 So are there any other questions or 7 comments? 8 If not, Michael, we can continue. 9 MR. TROTSKY: Okay. I'll be brief in 10 this section because we spent more time at it at 11 the committee meetings, but our governance 12 documents do require that I approve divisional 13 plans. And accordingly, we share those plans with 14 you, with all committee members and with the 15 board, for review and input. 16 Those plans are both in the expanded 17 agenda and also attached as Appendix E. I'm sure 18 you've all had a chance to look through them. 19 The plans are essentially a continuation of the work we've been doing for quite some time 20 21 Please feel free to discuss here any 22 suggestions you might have or contact me at any 23 time. We will revise the plans as appropriate to 24 incorporate suggestions -- and we already have

- 1 received a few -- before we finalize them.
- 2 But I do want to highlight just three
- 3 important new initiatives that each team within
- 4 PRIM, across the organization, is supporting.
- 5 First, we will be adding head count
- 6 across each functional area at PRIM to manage our
- 7 growing assets and our many programs here, new
- 8 initiatives. This has been a multi-year effort.
- 9 We are one of the leanest staffs in the country
- 10 compared to the size of our investment program,
- and we really need to build a deeper bench of
- 12 talent. That has been a clear directive of both
- the board and the committees over several years
- 14 now.
- 15 Second, the FUTURE Initiative. This is
- the program designed to support the investment
- 17 equity law that I discussed earlier and one that I
- 18 know the Treasurer has supported and created
- 19 actually. Very important to us all.
- 20 So for the FUTURE Initiative, we'll
- 21 continue to implement the four keys of that
- 22 program, which are, one, continue to allocate
- capital to diverse managers, we'll reduce barriers
- for diverse managers, enhance the reporting of our

- 1 progress as we do every year, and improve sourcing
- 2 and pipeline of diverse managers.
- We'll also champion the CFA Institute
- 4 Diversity Equity and Inclusion Code of Conduct.
- 5 You may remember that I was involved in the
- 6 formation of this important investment industry
- 7 initiative. We're going to continue to hire staff
- 8 to help oversee and expand the FUTURE Initiative.
- 9 And with regard to internal DE&I
- 10 initiatives, we'll continue to increase the
- 11 diversity of PRIM's staff and add depth throughout
- 12 the organization through hiring and talent
- 13 assessments.
- 14 And last, I already highlighted this,
- but the ESG committee. The entire staff is here
- 16 to support the ESG committee, to implement its
- duties and responsibilities, consistent with the
- 18 charter that we passed last year. And we will be
- 19 hiring staff to support that newly established
- committee, and we're delighted to work on that.
- 21 Again, the complete annual plans are in
- your package at Appendix E, also in the expanded
- agenda.
- I can take any questions or comments

- 1 here. Please feel free to reach out to me
- 2 privately, if you'd like. But we can do that,
- 3 pause for a minute, before moving on to the rest
- 4 of the agenda.
- 5 And by the way, this is not a voting
- 6 item. It's really just informational.
- 7 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Anybody?
- 8 MR. TROTSKY: Hearing no questions, I
- 9 guess the investment report is next.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. So the
- 11 first item on the investment report is the asset
- 12 allocation recommendation. And who will be
- 13 presenting that, Michael?
- 14 MR. TROTSKY: Jay Leu.
- 15 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I thought he was
- helping take care of the baby.
- 17 MR. LEU: I know.
- 18 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. So I'm going
- 19 to start off by seeking a motion and a second and
- then have you go, Jay, into the actual
- 21 recommendation.
- 22 So I seek a motion that the PRIM Board
- approve the Investment Committee's recommendation
- to adopt the 2023 asset allocation recommendation

as described in the expanded agenda, and further to authorize the executive director to take all

actions necessary to effectuate this vote.

4 Is there a motion?

3

- 5 MR. BROUSSEAU: So moved.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: And a second?
- 7 MR. NAUGHTON: Second.
- 8 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Thank you.
- 9 Go ahead, Jay.
- 10 MR. LEU: Thank you, Treasurer.
- 11 I am Jay Leu, director of risk. Today
- 12 I'm going to be filling in for Maria to present
- the asset allocation recommendation.
- 14 Congratulations to Maria and her family.
- Maria was able to present the asset
- 16 allocation recommendation to the Investment
- 17 Committee. There was a thorough vetting of that
- decision there. I will present a somewhat slimmed-
- down version of Maria's presentation.
- Tony, the slides, please.
- 21 The 2023 asset allocation recommendation
- represents no major changes to our previous
- 23 recommendation. Our 2023 recommendation includes
- 24 a 1 percent increase in the private equity range

- 1 to 13 to 19 percent and subsequently a 1 percent
- decrease in the global equity range, the public
- 3 equities, to 32 to 42 percent.
- 4 For reference, this slide also shows the
- 5 approved ranges across asset classes in recent
- 6 years, as well as this year's recommended range on
- 7 the far right side.
- 8 Next slide. The asset allocation
- 9 research program blends both quantitative and
- 10 qualitative insights into the analysis, while
- 11 focusing on our dual objective. The core
- framework uses a probabilistic-based approach to
- maximize the likelihood of achieving our dual
- 14 objective.
- 15 The dual objective incorporates a return
- objective and a drawdown objective. The return
- 17 objective is the probability of achieving a
- 18 7 percent annualized return over the next
- 19 10 years.
- The downside protection or drawdown
- objective is the probability of achieving no
- 22 drawdown greater than 20 percent within the next
- three years.
- Next slide. As a reminder, we start

- 1 with asset class returns. Transform the asset
- 2 classes into principal components through a
- 3 statistical approach. Then we simulate 10,000
- 4 return paths across 10 years. And finally, we
- 5 evaluate the probability of achieving our dual
- 6 objective.
- 7 Next slide. I'd like to highlight the
- 8 key findings from Maria's core asset allocation
- 9 framework and systematic tests.
- 10 On the left depicts the most additive to
- 11 the PRIT Fund, and on the right depicts the most
- detractive to the PRIT Fund.
- As you can see, private equity remains
- the most additive to the PRIT Fund with respect to
- the probability of achieving our dual objective.
- And as you can see on the right-hand side, public
- 17 equity sleeves detract the most or removing them
- improves the probability the most.
- 19 As part of the asset allocation research
- 20 program, we continue to be mindful of rebalancing
- 21 decisions and liquidity. Maria's team works
- 22 closely with asset class heads, getting their
- thoughts on feasibility and qualitative insights.
- 24 And therefore, we maintain our comfort with this

- 1 proposed recommendation.
- 2 Also Maria's team did a peer assessment
- 3 and found that PRIM's allocation to private equity
- 4 is in line with similar public plans and actually
- 5 significantly lower versus endowments. Thus, we
- 6 are confident in our asset allocation
- 7 recommendation with respect to private equity.
- 8 Before moving to a vote, I'd like to do --
- Actually, maybe I'll stop here and ask
- if there are any questions on the asset allocation
- 11 approach here.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Are there questions
- on the asset allocation?
- 14 I don't hear any, Jay. Go ahead.
- MR. LEU: Okay. So before moving on to
- 16 a vote, I'd like to do what we did at the IC
- meeting and offer some risk perspective.
- 18 So, Tony, if you could go to the risk
- 19 slides.
- The risk department looks at the total
- 21 PRIT Fund risk through the lens of the building
- 22 blocks of risk. The three building blocks, main
- building blocks, are equity risk, interest rate
- risk, credit risk. And then you have some other

- 1 private factors. Equity risk contributes 74 percent of 2 the total PRIT Fund risk. Interest rate. 3 1.3 percent. And credit, 2.7 percent. 4 Next slide. You can see global equity 5 and private equity together account for about 6 56 percent of the market value, but about 7 80 percent of the total risk. When we look at the 8 PRIT Fund, we think in terms of overall equity 9 risk. 10 And this lens of equity risk, credit 11 risk and interest rate risk has implications for 12 two things: how we think about benchmarks and 13 then implication for managing the private equity 14 weight. 15 We'll be discussing benchmarks, or 16 Shannon will be discussing benchmarks later, but 17 for asset allocation, this risk lens has 18 implications for managing the private equity 19 weight. 20 As you know, it is more difficult to 21 precisely manage that private equity weight and 22
- precisely manage that private equity weight and
 the cash flows. And Michael Trotsky has mentioned
 some of the crosscurrents and challenges that are
 present

in today's private equity market. We've all heard 1 of the denominator effect where the value of the 2 rest of the portfolio declines with public equity 3 and fixed income markets. Valuations of portfolio 4 companies within private equity, either write-5 downs or disagreements especially in growth equity 6 is a challenge in today's market. 7 But also importantly, distributions or 8 realizations are down, and there's a weak IPO 9 market. And then the result, as Michael Trotsky 10 mentioned, is the plan sponsors are not only 11 overallocated to private equity risk, but a large 12 portion are outside of their ranges. 13 So we continue to focus on managing the 14 weight and the cash flows of private equity. 15 As Michael also importantly mentioned, 16 I'll reiterate this. PRIM has benefited from 17 diversification by vintage years, being there to 18 participate in private equity markets when equity 19 markets are weak. That has been important to 20 PRIM's success. 21 And also that vintage year 22 diversification provides a nice consistent 23 liquidity cash flow profile so that we're getting 24

cash

- 1 back consistently over time.
- 2 And I'll reiterate what Michael said.
- 3 In this difficult environment of managing the
- 4 private equity weight, Alyssa Fiore and Michael
- 5 McGirr have done an outstanding job with
- 6 commitment modeling, where many plans have
- 7 struggled.
- Now, pertaining to private equity, risk
- 9 and the PE team are studying three things.
- 10 Thinking about widening the allocation range, we
- 11 have gone from 10 percent private equity weight to
- 12 18 percent over the last decade. The range is
- still 6 percent, that band. Many peers use a
- 14 10 percent range, so we're looking at that.
- 15 That's one thing.
- And then the second thing is managing
- 17 the risk if we go outside of the range. Given
- that this has happened to our peers, we want to be
- 19 mindful of this.
- And here, that's where our framework
- 21 comes into play. We look at the combined equity
- risk of global equity and private equity. All
- else being equal, we would look to cut global
- 24 equity exposure, if private equity did go outside

- the range. We would continue to manage combined
- equity risk. Again, we think in terms of equity
- 3 risk, interest rate risk and credit risk as the
- 4 building blocks.
- 5 And then the last, the third thing
- 6 we're looking at, is liquidity or cash flow.
- Although the PRIT Fund, as Maria mentioned at the
- 8 IC meeting and Michael also mentioned, has ample
- g liquidity and then also low liquidity demands.
- So those are the risk perspectives. I
- can take questions on that, or we can turn back to
- the asset allocation.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Jump in, everyone,
- if you have any questions.
- Go ahead, Jay.
- 16 MR. LEU: Thoroughly vetted at the IC.
- 17 So I'd like to end the presentation with
- the 2023 asset allocation recommendation, which
- includes a 1 percent upward shift in private
- 20 equity target range to 13 to 19 percent and a
- 21 1 percent downward shift in the global equity
- target range to 32 to 42 percent.
- So we can now proceed to the vote.
- MR. MONACO: Madam Treasurer, Peter.

- 1 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Go ahead, Peter.
- 2 MR. MONACO: Sorry. Hey, Jay,
- apologies. Can you remind me, what is the single-
- 4 point probability of the portfolio having a
- 5 20 percent drawdown?
- 6 MR. LEU: It's actually -- I think it's
- 7 like -- we didn't show that in here, but I think
- 8 it's like ninety -- like the modeling of it is
- 9 92 percent.
- 10 There was not a drawdown this time. I
- 11 think the high was the end of 2021. I think we
- 12 got to a 14 percent drawdown in this 2022
- environment. There has been a drawdown in the
- 14 2002 and the 2008-'09. The GFC, there was a
- 15 drawdown.
- But it's about -- like in the 90s. 92,
- 17 93 percent. Simulating it that way.
- MR. MONACO: And how should we think
- about that? Because this dummy says to himself,
- if you draw down 20 percent, it takes three-plus
- 21 years to recover your losses compounding at
- 22 7 percent. I mean understanding of course that
- often over albeit variable durations, drawdowns of
- that magnitude typically can be followed by

- 1 returns greater than 7 percent per annum.
- 2 You understand where I'm coming from?
- 3 MR. LEU: Right. Yes. And I guess it's
- 4 a question of tolerance. On the other side, we
- 5 are -- like, through the 10,000 paths simulating,
- 6 do you end up getting, over the 10-year period,
- 7 back to the return objective? And so that is
- 8 reflected, like if you experience the 20 percent
- 9 drawdown, there's the dual objective.
- 10 But I know what you're saying. If you
- get down 20 percent, are you going to make it to
- the 7 percent over the 10 years?
- MR. TROTSKY: Yes. I would add a couple
- takeaways. First, this is a dual objective.
- We're mandated really for a 7 percent return.
- 16 That's the actuarial rate of return. And in order
- to get there, of course we have a growth-oriented
- portfolio with 80 percent equity risk.
- So there's no other way to get to
- 20 7 percent without taking risk. The downside of
- that, of course, is you're going to be subject to
- down markets. So there's no free lunch in trying
- to achieve 7 percent. And there is a substantial
- probability that we will have down periods like

- 1 we've just gone through.
- 2 I think we did -- I think the
- 3 performance was very strong relative to what was
- 4 expected. So I think we're doing just fine.
- 5 MR. LEU: Do you have a thought, Peter,
- on, like, recalibrating or sort of the tolerance?
- 7 Because it's a tolerance measure. So this is --
- 8 Or it's possible, if you wanted to, we
- 9 could talk offline on that, but --
- 10 MR. MONACO: Yes. No urgency, at some
- 11 point.
- 12 Where I'm coming from with this sort of
- disconnected line of questioning is not any issue
- or concern. I'm sitting here saying to myself
- 15 actually quite the opposite.
- 16 2022 in the historic context was a very
- 17 unusual year. Equities and bonds generally both
- 18 got destroyed, and we were, air quotes, only down
- 19 10 percent. So that's actually encouraging to me.
- I guess if I sound a little confused or
- inadvertently displayed any concern, I guess,
- without saying it, I was a little surprised that
- the probability of a 20 percent drawdown, at least
- as modeled, is 92 percent.

- 1 MR. LEU: Yes.
- 2 MR. MONACO: But that's all.
- 3 MR. LEU: Yes. And for the 60/40, like
- 4 if you took public markets, I think there was a
- 5 drawdown this go-round in '22, barely. And I
- 6 think possibly also 2020. Like that March 2020
- 7 might have come close.
- 8 MR. MONACO: Okay. Yes. Thanks.
- 9 MR. LEU: But for us, this round in
- 10 2022, I think the PRIT Fund's drawdown was
- 11 14 percent. And that's from the high watermark to
- the low point.
- MR. MONACO: Okay.
- MR. LEU: On your question on tolerance,
- 15 I was just thinking -- I don't want to put words
- in your mouth. The 20 percent might be too big a
- 17 drawdown to -- it's kind of setting a dial here,
- and I'm sort of hearing that the 20 seems high to
- 19 you or something.
- MR. MONACO: I mean maybe possibly, but
- I guess to get at that, right, you need to know
- 22 the answer to the question how much are you
- diminishing your probability of earning 7 percent
- per year over 10 years if, for example, you took

- 1 the drawdown tolerance to 15 percent?
- 2 MR. LEU: Right. And that's where, to
- 3 Michael's point, to get to the 7 percent, you have
- 4 to have the growth bias and equity heavier to get
- 5 to that return objective.
- 6 MR. MONACO: Understood. And we have
- 7 the investment horizon to be able to do that.
- 8 So apologies. I didn't mean to sink an
- 9 inordinate amount of time on this.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: It's okay, Peter.
- 11 MR. BROUSSEAU: Madam Treasurer, could I
- 12 ask a question of Jay?
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes.
- MR. BROUSSEAU: Maybe he has the answer.
- 15 Historically, I can't recall -- and I've
- 16 been here since 1987. I cannot recall
- 17 historically when we've had any drawdown that has
- 18 come anywhere -- I mean to 20 percent.
- 19 Other than probably the Great Recession
- of -- what? -- 15 years ago, is there any
- 21 historical precedence for that happening to us?
- 22 MR. LEU: Right. So 2008-'09, there was
- 23 a drawdown of more than 20 percent for the PRIT
- 24 Fund. Same with 60/40.

- 1 And then also 2002-2003, which was kind
- of the tech bubble, and then Enron, WorldCom and
- 3 that, those are the only two occurrences back to
- 4 '95 for the PRIT Fund.
- 5 MR. BROUSSEAU: Thank you.
- 6 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. With no
- 7 more questions, I am going to proceed to a roll
- 8 call vote, and we already had a motion and a
- 9 second.
- 10 Bob?
- 11 MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen?
- 13 Ruth Ellen? You -- I don't see her name
- 14 here.
- 15 Oh, I see her name. I'll come back to
- 16 Ruth Ellen.
- 17 Ruth Ellen, try to get the computer on.
- 18 Theresa?
- 19 MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter?
- MR. MONACO: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Dennis?
- MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly?

- 1 MS. ROSE: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Myself, yes.
- Ruth Ellen, are you there?
- 4 It almost looks frozen, doesn't it?
- 5 MR. FALZONE: It looks like she's
- 6 frozen. We're trying to take a look at that now.
- 7 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Do we have enough
- 8 votes, Renee?
- 9 MS. LeFEVRE: We do.
- 10 TREASURER GOLDBERG: All right. The
- 11 motion carries.
- MS. LeFEVRE: The motion passes.
- 13 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Next item on
- 14 the agenda is also a voting item. Hedge fund
- 15 benchmark review. Take it away.
- MS. ERICSON: Good morning, Treasurer.
- 17 Good morning, committee members.
- 18 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Since this is a
- 19 voting item, I think what I'll do is I will ask
- for a motion first, and then we'll let you take it
- away, and then we'll vote.
- 22 So I seek a motion that the PRIM Board
- approve the Investment Committee's recommendation
- to approve the changes to the total core benchmark

- 1 and the implementation benchmark as described in
- 2 the expanded agenda, and further to authorize the
- 3 executive director to take all actions necessary
- 4 to effectuate this vote.
- 5 Is there a motion?
- 6 MR. BROUSSEAU: So moved.
- 7 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Second?
- 8 MR. NAUGHTON: Second.
- 9 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. Go
- 10 ahead. Thank you. Sorry to have interrupted.
- 11 MS. ERICSON: No problem.
- 12 I'm Shannon Ericson, a member PRIM's
- 13 risk team. As most of you know, Jay Leu and I
- have been working on a benchmark project along
- with Verus with input from the asset class teams,
- in this case, the PCS team.
- We hired Verus as our benchmark
- 18 consultant in January 2021. One of the initial
- 19 objectives for Verus was to help us do a
- comprehensive review of all the benchmarks we use
- 21 at PRIM.
- To date, we have reviewed and
- recommended changes for PRIM's private equity,
- 24 global equity, core fixed income, value-added

- 1 fixed income, private debt and real estate
- benchmarks.
- Today's recommendation is for hedge
- 4 funds. There are two benchmark recommendations
- for the hedge fund subcomponents as the Treasurer
- 6 mentioned --
- 7 MR. TROTSKY: Shannon, it's kind of
- 8 difficult to hear you. Is your microphone
- 9 switched on the right --
- 10 MS. ERICSON: I think so.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I actually was just
- 12 about to say the same thing.
- MS. ERICSON: Okay.
- 14 MR. FALZONE: Are you using your
- 15 laptop's microphone or your webcam's microphone?
- MR. GRISWOLD: Shannon, someone will be
- 17 up in a second to help take a look.
- MS. ERICSON: Okav.
- MR. LEU: Just one interim comment. I
- have some texts here. I'd like just to clarify
- 21 something.
- When I said the 92 percent chance,
- that's of no drawdown. So there would be
- an 8 percent chance of a drawdown.

- 1 People had texted me that they thought
- there might be a disconnect on what that was, so
- 3 just for Peter's sake.
- 4 MR. TROTSKY: 8 percent chance of a
- 5 20 percent drawdown.
- 6 MR. LEU: Right. The 92 percent was
- 7 achieving the objective.
- 8 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Right. The good
- 9 news is that's how I took it, Jay.
- MR. LEU: Okay.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Knowing a little
- 12 about these fund operations.
- MR. MONACO: If you had realized that,
- 14 Madam Treasurer, then you could have short-
- 15 circuited me.
- 16 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter, I find you
- as a very thoughtful board member, and I would
- 18 never have short-circuited you.
- 19 Let's see, Shannon. How are you doing?
- 20 MS. ERICSON: Dave just tried it. Does
- 21 that sound better?
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Oh, much better.
- MS. ERICSON: Okay. Sorry about that.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Why don't you start

- 1 again? Because I lost every other word that you
- 2 said.
- 3 MS. ERICSON: Okay. Great.
- 4 So I think everyone knows who I am now,
- 5 Shannon Ericson, Risk Team.
- 6 So we hired Verus as our benchmark
- 7 consultant in January 2021. One of the initial
- 8 objectives for Verus was to help us do a
- 9 comprehensive review of all the benchmarks we use
- 10 at PRIM. To date, we have reviewed and
- 11 recommended changes for PRIM's private equity,
- 12 global equity, core fixed income, value-added
- fixed income, private debt and real estate.
- 14 Today's recommendation is for hedge
- 15 funds. There are two benchmark recommendations
- for hedge funds, as the Treasurer mentioned.
- 17 The first is to introduce a new core
- 18 primary strategic benchmark for stable value and
- directional hedge funds, as well as the PAAMCO
- fund of funds.
- 21 The second is to recategorize the
- 22 current core benchmark for stable value and
- directional hedge funds to be the implementation
- or secondary benchmark.

1	Tony, if you could, turn to the
2	presentation in Appendix H. If you could, turn to
3	page 2.
4	Just to review, our philosophy for
5	choosing a benchmark is, one, it should be
6	representative of the opportunity set; two, it
7	should be reflective of the return and risk of
8	the asset or sub-asset class.
9	Some other important features which are
10	nice to have are the benchmark should be
11	investable and known before the fact, and it
12	should be measurable, transparent and unambiguous.
13	In the case of hedge funds, it was
14	difficult to achieve all the desired benchmark
15	characteristics, given the heterogeneity of the
16	underlying manager strategies. Instead, we
17	focused on the opportunity cost of each hedge fund
18	subasset class as a whole and their return
19	characteristics when selecting a strategic
20	benchmark.
21	In working with Verus on hedge funds,
22	they shared their belief that hedge fund
23	benchmarks should provide a link between
24	expectations and success.

- Tony, if you could, turn to the next page.
- PRIM's approach to benchmarking private assets has been to use a strategic benchmark or public-plus benchmark as the core or primary benchmark and a peer benchmark as the implementation or secondary benchmark. When using a strategic or public-plus benchmark, it is important to focus on longer term results, such as three to five years, to gauge private asset success.

In the short term, there can be mismatches between the public markets, which are priced daily, versus less frequent and often lagged valuations for private assets. This is particularly important to remember during volatile market environments such as now.

The strategic or primary benchmarks are used to measure the efficacy of the allocation decision. In other words, would we have been better off in the public markets rather than the private asset? For example, for private equity, we use a blended Russell 3000/Europe IMI benchmark to gauge how our private equity investments are

- 1 doing versus the public market alternative.
- The key question when choosing a
- 3 strategic benchmark is what public market exposure
- 4 are you getting with a particular investment in
- 5 terms of equity, credit and interest rates?
- 6 The implementation or secondary
- 7 benchmark is a measure of manager selection. It
- 8 helps us evaluate how PRIM's private assets have
- 9 performed versus their asset class peers. In
- other words, are we implementing the strategy well
- 11 by picking good managers?
- Next page, Tony.
- Just to give a brief background on the
- 14 hedge fund program, it is part of the strategic
- 15 allocation within the portfolio completion sleeve
- or PCS. Within the hedge fund program, we invest
- in direct hedge funds and fund of funds.
- 18 Direct hedge funds are split into two
- 19 subcomponents, stable value and directional hedge
- funds. The two groupings were created in early
- 21 2020 as part of PRIM's annual asset allocation to
- separate long-biased hedge funds from those with
- 23 near zero equity exposure.
- In the fund of funds group, PAAMCO is

- 1 one of the remaining legacy fund of funds
- 2 managers. PAAMCO targets an absolute return while
- 3 maintaining reasonably low volatility. The
- 4 manager invests in multiple hedge fund
- 5 substrategies and has a focus on emerging
- 6 managers.
- 7 The next page, Tony.
- 8 Stable value funds as a group have near
- 9 zero exposure to equity risk with a beta to the
- 10 S&P that is very close to zero. These investments
- 11 also have low exposure to credit and interest rate
- 12 risk on average. The PAAMCO fund of funds
- portfolio has a very similar risk profile. Due to
- this low market exposure, the public market or
- opportunity cost of this group of investments can
- be proxied by cash. Cash benchmarks, while not
- 17 perfect, are often used as benchmarks for absolute
- 18 return strategies.
- 19 The PCS team conducted a research
- 20 project on hedge fund practices among pension
- 21 plans and endowments. Their research included a
- 22 third-party benchmark survey of several asset
- allocators. Of the survey respondents, 70 percent
- used cash or cash-plus benchmarks to evaluate

- 1 hedge funds.
- While cash benchmarks are often used, it
- 3 is important to note the volatility mismatch.
- 4 Cash volatility is zero, but the volatility of
- 5 PRIM's hedge funds is greater than zero. To
- 6 compensate for this higher volatility and higher
- 7 return expectation, a premium needs to be added to
- g the cash benchmark return.
- 9 We are recommending a 200-basis-point
- premium, given the volatility of PRIM's stable
- value and PAAMCO portfolios. This is consistent
- with the range of premium for cash-plus benchmarks
- in the third-party survey. It is also the amount
- recommended by Verus, our benchmark consultant,
- based on their return analysis. We are
- recommending the same benchmark for stable value
- and PAAMCO.
- The directional hedge funds, on the
- other hand, tend to be long-biased and have a
- systematic exposure to equities. The typical
- beta to the equity market for these managers
- ranges from .4 to .6. Here, the public market
- exposure can be proxied by 50 percent MSCI ACWI
- 24 plus
 - 50 percent SOFR. We used 50 percent equity

- 1 exposure for the benchmark to reflect an equity
- 2 beta of .5 for the group.
- We chose MSCI ACWI over a U.S.-only
- 4 benchmark, as the geographical mix of the
- 5 underlying managers is roughly 60 percent U.S.,
- 6 40 percent the rest of the world, which is similar
- 7 to ACWI. The liquidity and volatility of these
- 8 assets are in line with the public markets so no
- 9 liquidity or volatility premium needs to be added.
- That's the end of my presentation. I
- 11 will take any questions.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Are there questions
- for Shannon?
- 14 I am hearing none. So seriously, if
- there are no questions, I'm going to proceed with
- 16 the vote.
- 17 Tony, do we know, is Ruth Ellen's -- is
- 18 it working now?
- 19 MR. FALZONE: Yes. I see her moving
- around.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. All
- 22 right. I'll begin with Bob.
- Bob? Bob Brousseau?
- 24 MR. FALZONE: He may have stepped away.

1 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. Ruth 2 Ellen? MS. FITCH: Yes. 3 4 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Theresa? MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes. 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter? 6 7 MR. MONACO: Yes. TREASURER GOLDBERG: 8 Dennis? 9 MR. NAUGHTON: Yes. 10 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly? 11 MS. ROSE: Yes. 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I'll try Bob one 13 more time. 14 Okay. Myself, yes. 15 The motion carries. 16 MS. ERICSON: Thank you. 17 TREASURER GOLDBERG: All right then. 18 Next item on the agenda is public markets. We'll first have a performance. Then we have one, two 19 20 voting items. 21 MR. McELROY: Great. 22 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I was going to say, 23 one of the Michaels, where are you? 24 MR. McELROY: Yes. Can everyone hear

- 1 me, just to check the sound? Is it good?
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes, yes. We can
- 3 hear you.
- 4 MR. McELROY: Great. So good morning.
- 5 This is Michael McElroy. I'll cover the fourth
- 6 quarter and 2022, the public market environment,
- 7 as well as the PRIT Fund results in this
- 8 environment.
- 9 To begin with and to reiterate what
- 10 Michael Trotsky had mentioned, it was certainly
- 11 welcome to see the recovery in the equity and bond
- markets in the fourth quarter after those three
- consecutive quarters of the negative returns in
- 14 these normally uncorrelated asset classes.
- 15 In the quarter, global equity returns
- ranged from up 7 in the U.S. markets to up 15 in
- 17 the non-U.S. markets. Value outperformed growth
- in all geographies. And for the year, equities
- 19 were down a bit less than 20 percent. And it was
- really broad-based across geography and sector,
- 21 with energy the only meaningful exception.
- 22 And just as in the fourth quarter, value
- was the highest-performing style in 2022. And
- this may be a trend that continues into at least

- 1 the first half of 2023, if not longer.
- Bonds were a bit more mixed. Shorter
- duration bonds in value-added areas such as high-
- 4 yield and emerging markets debt were up between 2
- 5 to 7 percent in the quarter. Longer duration
- 6 bonds lost value as the long-term interest rates,
- 7 which had declined through most of the fourth
- 8 quarter, ended the quarter slightly higher. And
- 9 for the year, core fixed income, depending on the
- duration, was down between 12 to 40 percent.
- 11 Value-added fixed income, which is less
- sensitive to the interest rate movements, did
- provide some downside cushion, with those
- 14 strategies declining only about 7 percent. The
- 15 U.S. and many developed markets' yield curves
- 16 remain inverted, and the Fed funds rate was
- increased over the fourth quarter, but
- 18 expectations from this point are for smaller and
- 19 more measured increases.
- 20 So given this backdrop, results for the
- 21 PRIT Fund were within expectations. All regions
- of our global equity portfolio outperformed in the
- fourth quarter with the strongest results seen
- from our developed international exposure.

Similarly for the year, our U.S. and
emerging markets managers outperformed, but our
developed international exposure and particularly
the growth style dragged down our overall results
in this region.

- Within fixed income, both core and valueadded slightly underperformed in the quarter. And
 for the year, core fixed income was in line with
 our benchmark, while our value-added fixed income
 underperformed due to credit conditions weakening
 throughout the year.
 - It's also worth noting that the fourth quarter marked the five-year anniversary since we started making allocations to our other credit opportunities bucket, where the PRIT Fund invests in credit strategies complementary to our high-yield bank loans or emerging markets debt exposures.
 - Though the fourth quarter was challenging for this bucket, over the five-year experience so far, it has been a source of uncorrelated returns and strong absolute and relative performance. And it's an area we continue to be excited about as market

- 1 dislocations and diminished liquidity have made
- 2 these credit strategies with stronger covenants,
- 3 better collateral and more conservative valuations
- 4 relatively more attractive.
- 5 There continued to be mixed signals on
- 6 the two most prominent topics impacting the
- 7 markets: inflation and the potential for
- 8 recession.
- 9 Inflation seems to be moderating
- somewhat in most geographies, with money supply
- and savings levels down and supply chain
- 12 disruptions less frequent. Labor shortages and
- wage costs continue to be sticky, and
- deglobalization may lengthen this inflationary
- 15 horizon.
- 16 With respect to recession, it could be
- 17 upon us as the inverted yield curve, weak and
- 18 falling leading economic indicators and
- manufacturing surveys are signaling a downturn.
- 20 On the flip side, the labor market
- 21 remains robust, and the overall credit conditions
- 22 benign. As noted last quarter, balance sheets had
- been fortified prior to the rate increases we saw
- last year, which should forestall any meaningful

- 1 uptick in defaults where we'd experience some
- level of recession. It's a murky picture, one
- 3 that we discuss with our managers to get their
- 4 views and positioning about.
- 5 In addition to these topics, our
- 6 managers have highlighted several other positives.
- 7 Supply chain issues have improved because
- 8 companies have diversified these supply chains.
- 9 India has been a particular beneficiary of this,
- 10 given manufacturing and transportation
- improvements made over the past decades.
- 12 Companies still report decent
- fundamentals, a finding that we corroborate within
- 14 PRIM among different asset class teams, though
- this is something that our managers continue to
- 16 monitor for signs of slowdown. China reopening
- and the boost this could provide to global growth
- is certainly a positive compared to last quarter
- 19 and earlier last year.
- 20 Risks our managers are focused on really
- 21 span ongoing issues like escalation of the war in
- 22 Russia and Ukraine and its effects, to new
- concerns like the potential U.S. government
- 24 shutdown relating to the debt ceiling

negotiations. Global housing price slowdowns and any knock-on effects to consumers is also being closely watched.

- So in closing, market conditions have been and remain choppy. We've built the public markets portfolio to weather this turbulence. As we've said before, although high volatility should be a good environment for active managers to add value, managing all these changing risks simultaneously can at times prove challenging.
 - We're encouraged by the diversification we've built into the PRIT Fund and that our managers have provided. We saw a nice recovery in the fourth quarter, and both relative and absolute returns remain strong over the long term in both equities and fixed income.
 - The aggregate risk of the overall equity and fixed income portfolios remains low, and the risk factors are balanced across our managers.
- 20 So with that, I'm happy to take any 21 questions anyone has.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Any questions at all for Mike?
- 24 Hearing none, we could go on to the

- 1 voting items.
- 2 MR. BROUSSEAU: Madam Treasurer, before
- you do, on the last vote on the benchmarks, I had
- 4 a glitch here, would not allow me to unmute
- 5 myself, but my vote was yes.
- 6 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Thank you.
- 7 All right then. What I'm going to do is
- 8 since there are no questions in terms of the
- 9 presentation, I'm going to seek a motion that the
- 10 PRIM Board approve the Investment Committee's
- 11 recommendation to approve the selection of Meketa
- 12 Investment Group to provide public markets
- advisory services to PRIM as described in the
- 14 expanded agenda, and further to authorize the
- 15 executive director to take all actions necessary
- 16 to effectuate this vote.
- 17 Is there a motion?
- MR. NAUGHTON: So moved.
- 19 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Is there a second?
- 20 MR. BROUSSEAU: Second.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Mike, why
- don't you just quickly describe that, and then
- we'll proceed to the vote.
- 24 MR. McELROY: I think this will be Andre

- 1 Abouhala.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Oh, okay. Sorry.
- 3 MR. McELROY: He'll be presenting for
- 4 the public markets team.
- 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. And will
- 6 Andre also be doing the second voting item?
- 7 MR. McELROY: No. That will be Chuck LaPosta.
- 8 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay, Andre. Go
- 9 ahead.
- 10 MR. ABOUHALA: Thank you, Treasurer
- 11 Goldberg. Good morning, everyone. Great to see
- 12 you all.
- 13 I am Andre Abouhala, investment officer
- on the public markets team. I will be presenting
- 15 the recommendation for the public markets advisory
- 16 services RFP.
- 17 PRIM issued the RFP on October 31, 2022.
- 18 By the deadline of December 2, we had received
- 19 seven proposals. Respondents included Aon,
- 20 Callan, Meketa, NEPC, RVK, Verus and Wilshire.
- 21 And the evaluation committee at PRIM consisted of
- 22 Michael McElroy, Chuck LaPosta, David Gurtz, Jay
- 23 Leu, Shannon Ericson, Tony Falzone, Matt Liposky,
- 24 Francesco Daniele and myself.

1	All of the responses were thoroughly
2	reviewed, and finalists were selected based on the
3	criteria detailed in the RFP. Five finalists were
4	selected for in-depth interviews to better
5	understand their approach, experience and
6	qualifications. These interviews were held in
7	person and virtually at PRIM offices.
8	After careful consideration, the team
9	unanimously recommends the selection of Meketa
10	Investment Group. Meketa is based in Westwood,
11	Massachusetts and have been solely focused on
12	investment advisory services since its inception
13	in 1974. The firm is 100 percent employee-owned
14	by more than 70 senior professionals, who are all
15	active within the firm.
16	Meketa is ranked among the top 10
17	largest investment consulting firms worldwide,
18	consulting on over 1.6 trillion in assets for
19	245 clients, including over 90 public clients.
20	The proposed primary advisor to our
21	account, Amy Hsiang, serves as Meketa's director
22	of public markets manager research. She has
23	20 years of industry experience, including
24	17 years focused on research and investment

- 1 management.
- 2 The account is further supported by Josh
- 3 Brough and Hayley Tran, who serve as co-heads of
- 4 equity at Meketa; Stephen MacLellan, managing
- 5 principal consultant; Mark and McKeown, who's head
- 6 of fixed income at Meketa. We are particularly
- 7 impressed with this group as they average 20 years
- 8 of industry experience overseeing major asset
- 9 classes at Meketa and work with other large public
- 10 pension clients like PRIM.
- 11 Given the size and scale of the team,
- 12 Meketa's services can be customized to complement
- our internal capabilities and address specific
- 14 needs. Their team will integrate into our
- 15 processes and can serve as an extension of staff
- where needed. We expect them to assist on a wide
- 17 range of areas, including strategic planning,
- 18 portfolio construction, investment due diligence,
- 19 manager selection, ongoing monitoring, ad hoc
- 20 research and reporting.
- 21 PRIM does have an existing relationship
- with Meketa. The firm currently serves as a
- 23 member of PRIM's pool of real estate and
- 24 timberland advisors and in that role have

- 1 collaborated on past credit opportunities with the
- 2 public markets team.
- 3 Lastly, in terms of cost, PRIM has
- 4 negotiated an annual fee that was competitive with
- 5 the other proposals received.
- 6 Thank you for your attention and
- 7 consideration. I'm happy to answer any questions
- 8 you may have.
- 9 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Any questions at
- 10 all for Andre?
- 11 MR. NAUGHTON: Just a procedural
- 12 question, Madam Treasurer. Thank you.
- 13 Good morning, Andre. Thank you for a
- 14 very complete presentation.
- 15 I was just curious in arriving at this
- 16 recommendation that you're making this morning,
- 17 was that -- of your study committee, was that a
- 18 vote, or was it consensus?
- 19 MR. ABOUHALA: There was a vote, but it
- was consensus as well.
- 21 MR. NAUGHTON: Okay. So there was no
- 22 substantial disagreement over the recommendation
- 23 within the committee?
- MR. ABOUHALA: None.

1 MR. NAUGHTON: Okay. Thanks very much. 2 MR. ABOUHALA: Thank you. 3 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Thank you, Dennis. 4 Any further questions? 5 Hearing none, I'm proceeding with the 6 vote. 7 Bob? 8 Can't hear you. I'll come back to you. 9 MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes. We have again. 10 TREASURER GOLDBERG: All right. Bob? 11 MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes. 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen? 13 MS. FITCH: Yes. 14 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Theresa? 15 MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes. 16 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter? 17 MR. MONACO: Yes. 18 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Dennis? 19 MR. NAUGHTON: Yes. 20 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly? 21 MS. ROSE: Yes. 22 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Myself, yes. 23 The motion carries. Thank you. 24 Okay then. Now, I am going to seek a

- 1 motion in a second, and then we will get a
- 2 presentation on the Biopharma Credit investment.
- I seek a motion that the PRIM Board
- 4 approve the Investment Committee's recommendation
- 5 to approve a commitment of up to \$150 million to
- 6 Biopharma Credit Investments V as described in the
- 7 expanded agenda, and further to authorize the
- 8 executive director to take all actions necessary
- 9 to effectuate this vote.
- 10 Is there a motion?
- 11 MR. BROUSSEAU: So moved.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Second?
- MS. FITCH: Second.
- 14 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Now, who is
- 15 presenting this, Michael?
- MR. LaPOSTA: This will be me, Chuck
- 17 LaPosta.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Chuck, thank you.
- There's so many people coming and going
- 20 across my screen that I just need to, like, be
- 21 prompted on this.
- MR. LaPOSTA: We're happy to help you
- out with that, for sure.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Thank you, Chuck.

1	MR. LaPUSTA: Good morning, everyone.
2	As mentioned, Chuck LaPosta, director of
3	fixed income, and I will be discussing the
4	recommendation of \$150 million investment in
5	Biopharma Credit Investments V. The fund is an
6	open-ended strategy managed by Pharmakon Advisors
7	that invests in life sciences companies, primarily
8	by making senior secured loans backed by FDA-
9	approved commercial stage products.
10	Pharmakon has two investment vehicles
11	for a total of about 3 billion in firm AUM. Deals
12	are expected to be shared equally across these two
13	vehicles with some possibility of co-investment
14	being made available to LPs where transaction
15	sizes warrant.
16	Pharmakon is a minority-owned
17	organization who reached out to PRIM in the spring
18	of 2021 upon learning of our FUTURE Initiative.
19	It was founded in 2009 by a Pedro Gonzalez
20	de Cosio and Pablo Legoretta, who is also
21	cofounder and CEO of Royalty Pharma. Royalty
22	Pharma is an independent organization with whom
23	Pharmakon shares investment ideas and certain
24	supporting resources. In 2011, they added Martin

- 1 Friedman as a third principal of the firm.
- 2 Pedro and Martin lead the investment
- 3 process for Pharmakon and are supported by three
- 4 analysts. The team has experience in investment
- 5 banking, equity research, healthcare finance and
- 6 has degrees in biosciences and investments. The
- 7 team uses its diverse backgrounds of education and
- 8 experience to work collectively on all deals that
- 9 go into the portfolio.
- 10 Pharmakon meets with 150 companies a
- 11 year and uses its banking, personal and
- 12 professional relationships, as well as deal
- 13 sourcing from Royalty Pharma, to find actionable
- 14 investments. They have historically made four to
- 15 six investments per year and typically only invest
- after many years of following a company.
- 17 Investments are made to public companies
- with FDA-approved products, most of which have
- 19 established sales and cash flows, as well as
- 20 sufficient patent protection to support the loans.
- 21 These loans have seniority over any other debt or
- shareholder equity and can be backed by cash flows
- from existing products and other corporate assets,
- including cash, property, plant and equipment, or

- 1 intellectual property.
- 2 Pharmakon's target return is in line
- 3 with other investments in our OCO portfolio.
- 4 However, this asset-backed strategy relies on
- 5 drugs, devices and diagnostics with little
- 6 competition in unmet medical needs, often in
- 7 critical care disease categories. This should
- 8 provide some diversification from our other credit
- 9 investments and strategies, which may be more
- 10 sensitive to economic conditions.
- 11 Loans are typically made to a five-year
- 12 maturity but often pay off before that. Early
- prepayment can increase IRRs above the
- 14 underwritten target. Pharmakon has made
- 15 47 investments since 2009. They have had a strong
- 16 track record of success, and there have been no
- 17 credit-related losses.
- As I mentioned, PRIM began discussions
- 19 with Pharmakon in spring of 2021 after the
- 20 announcement of our FUTURE Initiative. We
- 21 commissioned Albourne's ODD review shortly after
- 22 that in the fall of '21. Albourne's report
- identified a few areas of deficiency that put the
- investment recommendation on hold.

1	Together, we worked with Pedro and
2	Martin to express our concerns and offer up
3	recommendations to improve their overall
4	operations. In the six to nine months following,
5	Pharmakon has heeded our advice and made
6	improvements to their operations to specifically
7	address our concerns. Albourne recently
8	rereviewed these changes and have improved their
9	overall assessment of Pharmakon's operational
10	capabilities.
11	With that, I will open it up to any
12	questions.
13	TREASURER GOLDBERG: I would like to
14	comment that and I used this with another
15	presentation on how excellent the FUTURE
16	Initiative work and the structure of it is
17	effectuating positive results. And this
18	particular recommendation is a perfect example of
19	that, that we were able to look at a potential
20	investment, that Albourne could see a small
21	weakness, make a recommendation. The group worked
22	with Albourne, and then we were able to do an
23	investment.

I think this is a suburb approach and

- 1 really by example explains what the FUTURE
- 2 Initiative is about and how it can be successful.
- 3 So, Chuck, thank you for the
- 4 presentation.
- I don't know if there are any other
- 6 questions or comments. If not, I will proceed
- 7 with the vote.
- 8 Hearing none, Bob?
- 9 MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes.
- 10 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen?
- 11 MS. FITCH: Yes.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Theresa?
- MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes.
- 14 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter?
- MR. MONACO: Yes.
- 16 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Dennis?
- MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly?
- 19 MS. ROSE: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Myself, yes.
- 21 The motion carries.
- 22 Okay.
- 23 MR. TROTSKY: Bill Li is next.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes. Thank you,

- 1 Michael. I actually went and wrote it down, but
- 2 I'll find a strategy at some point to be able to
- 3 jump more quickly on those. Okay then.
- 4 MR. TROTSKY: We can give you those in
- 5 advance next time.
- 6 TREASURER GOLDBERG: It's not a bad idea
- 7 just because I've got 12 pieces of paper in front
- 8 of me.
- 9 MR. TROTSKY: Right.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: All right then.
- 11 Now, there are no voting items, but Bill is going
- to give us a performance summary on portfolio
- 13 completion strategies.
- 14 Thank you, Bill.
- MR. LI: Thank you, Madam Treasurer.
- 16 That's right. This is more an update from PCS.
- 17 And my name is Bill Li, senior
- investment officer and director of portfolio
- 19 completion strategies or PCS.
- 20 One of our efforts throughout 2022 was
- 21 to landscape peer allocators' best practices and
- work with the risk team to further clarify PRIM
- 23 hedge fund's diversifier role.
- 24 As you have heard earlier from Shannon

Ericson's presentation on hedge fund benchmark 1 review. PRIM hedge fund's return and risk 2 objectives now have been further metrified. 3 that should give my team more clearheadedness in 4 making investments and guide us to communicate 5 results more effectively. 6 Speaking of results, in Q4 2022, PRIM 7 hedge funds increased 1.5 percent, beating 8 benchmark by 40 basis points. And hedge funds 9 account for 90 percent, the majority of PCS. 10 The other 10 percent of PCS, real 11 assets, was marked down by 5.9 percent. Since 12 inheriting the coverage of real assets in early 13 2022, the team has spent tremendous time 14 rationalizing this pocket. With help from 15 multiple other teams, including real estate, legal 16 and risk, we look to finish the review by mid-17 2023. 18 So, netting between hedge funds and real 19 assets, PCS in total increased 77 bps in Q4. For 20 the full calendar year, PRIM hedge fund was 21 slightly down by 1.9 percent with an equity beta 22 of merely .1. That provided ample risk buffer to 23

the total PRIT Fund. Viewed from another angle,

- 1 PRIT Fund would have been 1.2 percent worse off 2 without hedge funds last year. 3 Over a longer time frame of three years,
- 4 PRIM hedge fund annualized 2.8 percent with a 5 market beta of .2. Within the same time frame, a 6 60/40 market portfolio annualized 1.3 percent, 7 meaning PRIM hedge fund's 2.8 percent outperformed 8 the market portfolio, meanwhile serving as a risk 9 buffer. And we are happy to have accomplished 10 that.
- If I may direct your attention from past performance to 2023 and forward, I would like to 12 13 share some observations that should mean an 14 exciting year for the PRIM hedge fund allocation.

11

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

Firstly, stable value funds, the biggest hedge fund sleeve that delivered a positive 2.3 last year, is largely comprised of relative value and low-beta event-driven mandates. Those mandates make money by smartly capturing spread. And spread, be it credit spreads or mispriced arbitrage spread, have been exceptionally wide so that managers across the board are anticipating mid- to high single-digit return with lower risk.

Secondly, directional funds are stock

- 1 pickers and credit pickers that are absolute-
- 2 return-oriented. They see tremendous valuation
- 3 support in selective papers. This year, we should
- 4 expect ample alpha potential from directional
- 5 managers' security selection.
- In summary, we have obtained higher
- 7 confidence that PRIM hedge fund is in a very good
- 8 position to perform this calendar year.
- 9 And with that, I'll open the floor for
- 10 questions.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Any questions for
- 12 Bill? Anyone?
- 13 Bill, you're off the hook.
- MR. LI: Thanks.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: All right. Thank
- 16 you very much, Bill.
- We will be moving on to private equity.
- 18 Mike McGirr.
- 19 MR. McGIRR: Thank you, Madam Treasurer.
- 20 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I do believe we're
- going to have one, two, three voting items. So go
- ahead and do the performance and commitment
- summary, and then I will do the motions prior to
- your description of the items.

MR. McGIRR: Thank you, Madam Treasurer. 1 2 Private equity had a down quarter. We 3 were down 51 basis points gross or 80 basis points 4 Now, that decline was less than the decline net. 5 of the public markets in Q3, where the Russell 6 3000 was down 4.5 percent, and the MSCI Europe IMI 7 was down almost 11 percent. 8 Private equity's trailing one-year return is negative 4.75 percent gross or 5.75 9 net. And again, that compares favorably, less 10 negative than the return of the Russell 3, down 11 almost 18 percent, and the MSCI Europe, down 12 almost 27 percent for that trailing one-year 13 return as of 9/30. 14 Our 3-, our 4- and our 10-year numbers 15 remain strong at 26, 23 and 21 percent, 16 respectively. Those are all gross figures. 17 And I want to provide some additional 18 color on the quarter and the trailing one-year. 19 Venture capital and growth equity continue to 20 give back some of the gains that they had in 2020 21 and 2021. Our growth equity portfolio is flat for 22 the quarter, but it's down 16 percent for the 23 trailing one-year. Venture was down 2 percent for 24 the quarter and is down 17 percent for the trailing

- 1 one-year.
- 2 Buyouts, which make up the majority of
- 3 the private equity portfolio, have been more
- 4 resilient in this market. Small and midsize
- 5 buyouts were down 2 percent for the guarter. And
- 6 they're actually up 3 percent on a trailing one-
- 7 year basis. The larger end of the buyout
- 8 portfolio has not performed quite as well, down
- 9 4 percent for the quarter and down 7 percent for
- 10 the trailing one-year.
- 11 And what we're seeing, as Jay had talked
- 12 about equity risk, holistically in private equity,
- we're seeing similar trends that you're seeing in
- 14 the public markets. The private equity portfolio
- showed strength, and energy, industrials and
- 16 materials really leading the way, while our
- 17 technology portfolio lagged.
- Also as Mike McElroy had mentioned,
- value has really outperformed. And what we've
- seen over the course of the year is our value and
- 21 our deep value managers have been having great
- years, and contrast that with our later stage
- venture and our growth managers, which have
- 24 struggled.

1	Turning to cash flows. We've now seen
2	one full year of negative cash flows with
3	contributions outpacing distributions. This is on
4	page 18 of the board materials.
5	And what is masked in these numbers is
6	the scaling of PRIM's co-investment portfolio and
7	its relative immaturity compared to the maturity
8	of the rest of the private equity portfolio.
9	Now, that being said, our team has an
10	increased focus on distributions in the quarters
11	to come as it's a key performance indicator, as
12	well as an important measure of portfolio health
13	and quality.
14	Our entire private equity assets stayed
15	about flat for the quarter, totaling
16	\$16.2 billion, and decreased slightly as a
17	percentage of the PRIT Fund, 17.7 percent, as we
18	had discussed earlier.
19	A couple other things to note. On
20	page 18 and 19 of your materials, you've likely
21	noticed a change to our commitment summary table.
22	Based on feedback from Investment Committee
23	members and board members, we've added our closed
24	commitments for the FUTURE Initiative for the

- 1 first time. And we've also added the total
- 2 approved amount of our calendar year 2022 co-
- 3 investments.
- 4 So the total summary for 2022 is
- 5 25 funds and 16 co-investments, totaling
- 6 \$547 million of co-investments. And as a
- 7 reminder, that's an important part of our Project
- 8 SAVE, as these co-investments have no fees and pay
- 9 no carried interest.
- 10 And finally, for the year ahead, as you
- 11 voted on earlier, we plan to tick up our range of
- 12 private equity, 13 to 19 percent. That translates
- into a commitment goal of roughly 2.2 billion to
- 14 \$3 billion for the calendar year '23.
- 15 We will redouble our efforts on
- 16 improving the portfolio quality.
- 17 And finally, we will look to add to this
- 18 very high-performing, very productive team that we
- 19 have.
- 20 Happy to take any questions or comments
- on the portfolio or the markets before moving to
- 22 our voting items.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: So any questions
- for Michael? The voting items will be grouped

- 1 because they are all follow-on investments.
- 2 MR. NAUGHTON: Madam Treasurer, I have a
- 3 quick question when the time is right.
- 4 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Go right ahead. Is
- 5 it on what Mike presented?
- 6 MR. NAUGHTON: It relates to our
- 7 investments in that category in general.
- I was just curious, and I know this is
- 9 sort of a very broad question, but I'm just
- 10 wondering whether -- Michael, thank you -- if
- 11 there's been any sense in our investments that
- there's been any kind of an impact by the issues
- 13 between the U.S. and China over chips?
- MR. McGIRR: Over "chips"? You mean
- 15 semiconductors?
- MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
- MR. McGIRR: That's a great question.
- In terms of what we're seeing in the CHIPS Act and
- the incentives and focus towards developing and
- 20 manufacturing chips in the United States, we're
- seeing additional impacts into that area. As we
- look deeper into the technology sectors' performance, we
- see software has really had a down year.
- 24 And actually semiconductors have been

- positive on a relative basis. So that asset 1 class, I think, has -- in the U.S. at least, has 2 seen the benefit of some of these crosscurrents, 3 especially geopolitical crosscurrents. 4 5 6 I'm not sure if that's helpful, Dennis. 7 MR. NAUGHTON: Oh. it is. And I don't 8 envy you guys in your position because the ripples 9 from that issue continue to broaden and affect not 10 only our relationship with China and maybe other 11 Asian countries, but also with our European allies in terms of a broad range of investments. 12 13 MR. McGIRR: Yes. I would agree with I think what we have seen and heard from our 14 managers and our businesses is reshoring, kind of 15 deglobalization, decoupling, you're seeing a lot 16 of focus on supply chain resilience. 17 So I think all those are major themes 18 that are affecting both public and private equity 19 companies broadly. 20
- 21 MR. NAUGHTON: Thank you very much,

22

Michael.

- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Thank you, Dennis.
- MR. MONACO: Madam Treasurer, Peter.

- 1 I've got a quick question.
- Hey, Michael.
- 3 MR. McGIRR: Hey, Peter.
- 4 MR. MONACO: Where do you think we are
- 5 in the process of private equity portfolio
- 6 markdowns broadly?
- 7 MR. McGIRR: That is the million dollar
- question. I think there's a difference right now
- 9 in the different strategy types that you're
- seeing. And as a general rule, I think about
- earlier stage companies that may or may not have
- found product market fit, all else being equal,
- are more difficult to value. There's just more
- uncertainty. There's a broader range of outcomes
- compared to larger, and if you push that to an
- extreme, publicly traded companies, where their
- shares are traded. So I think it's a bit of a
- 18 spectrum.
- And then what I and the team have come
- to learn and appreciate is private equity
- valuations are very manager-specific. Valuation
- 22 policies matter. Approach matters. And
- consistency really, really matters.
- So I think it's a part of the investment

- 1 cycle to be skeptical and to appreciate that not
- 2 all fund valuations are created equally.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter, was that
- 4 helpful?
- 5 MR. MONACO: It is. I guess I'm looking
- 6 at it, I'm sure, overly simplistically, but equity
- 7 markets peaked a year or so ago. They're broadly
- 8 down 15, 20 percent or so. And while completely
- 9 agreeing that every portfolio, every manager,
- 10 every strategy is different, we all kind of know
- 11 that there's as much art as science involved in
- the valuation exercises. And so whatever the kind
- of cumulative markdown that may be required is, it
- 14 will be dragged out.
- 15 So maybe it's not a fair question, but
- orders of magnitude and just using arbitrary
- 17 numbers, if private equity portfolios broadly
- needed to be marked 20 percent, have they taken
- 19 half of that and so there's half to come?
- 20 MR. McGIRR: I think that it's really
- 21 difficult to predict, Peter. And I wish I had
- 22 clarity that I could offer. I don't.
- I'd offer a couple data points. One is
- we're seeing broadly across the secondary market,

LP interests trading at discounts to NAV. I think 1 that's a data point. 2 I think as we discussed earlier, there's 3 a liquidity aspect to that market, right, for 4 sellers or folks that need to sell. And that 5 liquidity in an illiquid asset costs a pretty penny. 6 The other thing I would offer is what we 7 see is private equity is highly correlated with 8 public equity. And as Mike McElrov had 9 mentioned, there's three negative quarters of 10 public equity performance and then positive 11 performance in the fourth quarter. 12 And we have observed private equity 13 having smooth, muted returns on that upside and 14 that downside capture over time. And I would 15 expect that trend to continue. 16 17 MR. MONACO: Thanks a lot. 18 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter? 19 MR. MONACO: Yes. Thank you. I'm good. 20 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Thank you. 21 With that, any other questions for Mike, 22 or should we move on to the voting items? I would

24 Alyssa, are you presenting the voting

say we should move on to the --

- 1 items or Mike? Who is?
- 2 MR. McGIRR: I'm going to run through
- 3 the three managers quickly and then my colleagues
- 4 Alyssa, Helen and Tim, who led the work on these
- 5 investments, will be happy to answer any questions
- 6 or comments.
- 7 But in prior practice, these are all
- 8 high conviction reups so we're going to take them
- 9 all in one vote.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Right. So I'll do
- 11 the motion then.
- 12 I would seek a motion that the PRIM
- 13 Board approve the Investment Committee's
- recommendation to approve the following follow-on
- 15 commitments as described in the expanded agenda:
- one, up to \$300 million to Hellman & Friedman
- 17 Capital Partners Fund IX, LP; up to \$285 million
- to GTCR Fund XIV, LP; up to \$335 million to TA XV,
- 19 LP; and up to \$35 million to TA Select
- 20 Opportunities Fund III, LP, and further to
- 21 authorize the executive director to take all
- 22 actions necessary to effectuate this vote.
- 23 Is there a motion?
- MR. BROUSSEAU: So moved.

- 1 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Is there a second?
- 2 MR. NAUGHTON: Second.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then.
- 4 MR. NAUGHTON: Theresa got in there
- 5 ahead of me, though.
- 6 MS. McGOLDRICK: Oh, that's okay. I was
- 7 muted. Doesn't matter.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: You know what?
- 9 Theresa hasn't gotten to second anything. Renee,
- 10 put Theresa in on that.
- 11 All right. Go ahead.
- MR. McGIRR: Thank you. I'll be brief,
- and then we can jump into any questions or
- 14 comments.
- 15 Hellman & Friedman Fund XI. Hellman is
- 16 a longstanding buyout manager for PRIM based in
- 17 San Francisco. They have additional offices in
- 18 New York and London.
- 19 PRIM made our first investment -- Bob,
- 20 I'm sure you remember it -- back in 1995 in
- 21 Fund III and has since committed to eight funds
- 22 and completed four co-investments.
- 23 Hellman will continue to pursue its same
- strategy of building a concentrated portfolio of

- 1 high quality, market-leading businesses in the
- 2 U.S. and in western Europe.
- 3 Hellman has one fund series and a
- 4 focused investment strategy, led by a very
- 5 experienced senior team that has invested through
- 6 multiple cycles.
- We are recommending 300 million to Fund XI.
- 8 GTCR Fund XIV. Another longstanding
- 9 buyout manager for PRIM. Headquartered in
- 10 Chicago.
- 11 For over three decades, PRIM has
- invested in their flagship funds, more recently
- into their strategic growth fund, and we've
- 14 completed a co-investment.
- We've been rewarded with superb,
- persistent performance and a strong partnership.
- 17 GTCR has pioneered and refined its trademark
- 18 leader's strategy with a management-centric
- approach to acquiring and building market-leading
- companies.
- 21 We're pleased with our ability to
- increase exposure with this manager and recommend
- 23 a commitment of up to \$285 million to GTCR.
- 24 And TA Associates. TA XV is the

- 1 flagship product for TA Associates. PRIM's been
- 2 invested with TA since 1997. This would be our
- 3 ninth investment. They have generated very strong
- 4 returns for PRIM on very large dollar amounts.
- 5 TA XV will target growth-oriented, high
- 6 quality, middle market companies across the firm's
- 7 core sectors of tech, healthcare, financial
- 8 services, consumer and business services. The
- 9 fund will make between 50 and 60 equity
- 10 investments.
- And we're recommending a commitment of
- 12 \$335 million to TA XV.
- 13 And finally, TA Select Opps Fund III.
- 14 Select Opps is a "best idea" fund, designed to
- purchase equity in select high-performing, high
- quality, existing TA companies.
- 17 We expect Select Opps to be more
- 18 concentrated than the flagship fund, making
- 19 approximately 15 investments.
- TA believes they have asymmetric
- 21 knowledge in assessing the likelihood of future
- growth prospects in these businesses, due to their
- existing knowledge of the company and management
- 24 team.

- 1 We're recommending a \$35 million 2 commitment to TA Select Opps III. 3 The team and I are happy to take any 4 questions on TA, GTCR and Hellman & Friedman. 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. Are 6 there questions? 7 Madam Treasurer? MR. BROUSSEAU: 8 TREASURER GOLDBERG: The whole team is 9 here, ready to respond. 10 Yes, Bob. 11 MR. BROUSSEAU: Not a question as much 12 as a comment. Peter's comments a few minutes ago 13 caused me to double back in my brain and start 14 doing some thinking. But then I looked at the 15 three recommendations, and going back to 1995, and 16 these have been really gold standard investments 17 that we have made with these three private equity 18 investments. And in good times and bad times, 19 they have produced, and they have done very well 20 by us. 21 So considering that, I would think that 22 perhaps this is one of the best investments that 23 PRIM has made over the years in terms of
- 24 alternative investment in private equity. And I

- 1 strongly support the recommendations for these
- 2 three investments.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Thank you,
- 4 Bob.
- 5 Are there any questions?
- 6 Hearing none, we'll proceed with the
- 7 vote.
- 8 Bob?
- 9 MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes.
- 10 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen?
- 11 I think we lost her.
- 12 Theresa?
- MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes.
- 14 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter?
- MR. MONACO: Yes.
- 16 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Dennis?
- MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly?
- MS. ROSE: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Myself, yes.
- 21 The motion carries.
- 22 Okay then. Thanks, Mike and team.
- Next item on the agenda is performance
- summary only. No voting items, and it's real

- 1 estate and timberland. Tim Schlitzer.
- 2 MR. SCHLITZER: Good morning. I'll also
- 3 ask can everybody hear me okay? I think my
- 4 microphone is okay.
- 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes, we hear you.
- 6 MR. SCHLITZER: Good. I see Michael
- 7 giving me a thumbs-up.
- 8 So as you just said, Treasurer, I'm just
- 9 going to go through performance today, will not
- speak to any specific materials, but there is
- 11 supplemental information in your board package.
- 12 So total real estate returns,
- 7.7 percent for the year, and we were obviously
- 14 pleased about that. Michael referenced it,
- 15 particularly during a more challenging year across
- other asset classes. And I think this result does
- 17 very much support the diversification benefits of
- 18 real estate in the portfolio.
- 19 It's not lost on me, and we've talked
- 20 about this, that it's a little bit counter-
- 21 intuitive. We really did see very strong capital
- 22 market flows in the first half of 2022. And I
- 23 think to a certain extent, that pricing was
- 24 maintained somewhat throughout the summer. We did

- 1 see capital pull back in the second half of the
- 2 year.
- 3 I would say more importantly probably,
- 4 we really did see very high renter demand and
- 5 increasing construction costs virtually throughout
- 6 the entire year. So that kept supply in check,
- 7 and it provided a lot of support for operating
- 8 income.
- The statistics that we've seen, market
- operating income was up 9 percent during the year.
- 11 That's across all property types. That includes
- 12 office.
- So across some of the more in-favor
- sectors, you saw even higher numbers. So I think
- 15 that's a lot of what is behind the positive
- 16 returns for the year.
- 17 And this is the type of inflation
- 18 response that we would have expected. So it does
- make sense, I think, in our minds.
- I'll just point out, and Michael
- referenced this as well, our reported benchmark
- return was 12.8 percent, which does equate to
- 23 underperformance of about 500 basis points.
- 24 The underperformance does lie in the

- 1 private numbers, and it's due to a benchmark
- timing mismatch, which we talked about frequently.
- When we unlag the benchmark, so we're
- 4 using the Q4 annual benchmark and inserting that
- 5 in, the one-year index drops from 21 percent to
- 6 6.6 percent, which results in PRIM private
- 7 outperformance of about 770 basis points. So very
- 8 strong actual outperformance there.
- 9 A little bit more detail. Private real
- 10 estate returned 14.3 percent for the year. Real
- 11 estate leverage added 304 basis points to the
- 12 unlevered return.
- And I'll just mention that 90 percent of
- our debt is fixed rate, a great position to be in
- in this environment. And this debt has become
- 16 more valuable as rates have increased, resulting
- in some mark to market so that added to returns.
- 18 Also mention regarding portfolio
- 19 leverage, we paid off this week about \$175 million
- in portfolio debt, and I'll compliment John La
- 21 Cara there, who's effectively the CFO for this
- 22 portfolio and does a great job with our capital
- 23 structure.
- So we chose to partially delever the

- 1 portfolio rather than borrowing in this
- 2 environment. I think a good decision, and that
- 3 was fully supported by the Real Estate Committee.
- 4 Just a few comments on the public real
- 5 estate market. So REITs were down 22.2 percent
- 6 for the year. That's our portfolio. Our managers
- 7 did add value in a difficult environment. Both
- 8 managers outperformed with total outperformance
- 9 coming in at 228 basis points.
- 10 Obviously we had divergence between the
- 11 private and the public markets in terms of
- 12 returns. And we've talked about that. We're
- already beginning to see some reconvergence, which
- 14 we expected. The private index did have a
- 15 negative mark in Q4.
- 16 Year to date this year, REITs are up
- 17 almost 11 percent as of this morning. That's
- 18 300 basis points roughly over the S&P 500. So we
- 19 always expect short-term differences between
- 20 public and private real estate, but over the long
- 21 term, we expect them to generally perform in line.
- So I'm going to leave it at that for
- 23 real estate. Please cut in with any questions. I
- have a few comments on timber, and then I'll wrap.

1 So on timber performance, the total 2 timberland return for the year was 8.2 percent. 3 Similar to real estate, great to see the positive 4 performance and great to see the diversification 5 effects of the asset class. 6 Timberland was highly sought after 7 during the calendar year. I'd apply that comment 8 to virtually the entire year. Industrial buyers 9 and REITs had a lot of cash. They were flush with 10 cash from lumber gains. You're well-aware, I 11 know, of the high lumber prices that we've 12 experienced. 13 And those groups also had a desire to 14 manage their supply chains by owning more of the 15 inputs to their production facilities. We saw 16 investors seeking hard assets in an inflationary 17 environment and willing to pay more for those. 18 And lastly, timberland is generally an 19 unlevered asset class. So it was much less 20 impacted by the interest rate increases that we 21 saw. 22 On a relative performance basis, we did 23 have some benchmark underperformance. Michael

mentioned that. I'll really just kind of echo

- 1 what he said. We did have a full appraiser
- 2 rotation, and we've seen this kind of noise from
- 3 these rotations before. We had a very similar
- 4 dynamic a few years ago when we did a complete
- 5 rotation.
- And we're digging into it, of course.
- We're very confident in the quality of this
- 8 portfolio, but it is worth it to dig into the
- 9 appraisers' forecasts for things like log prices
- and harvest schedules. So we're doing that now,
- 11 but again, very confident in the quality of this
- 12 portfolio.
- 13 So I'm going to leave it at that, but of
- 14 course happy to answer any questions.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Do we have
- 16 questions for Tim? Okay.
- 17 Hearing none, thank you.
- 18 MR. SCHLITZER: Thanks, everybody.
- 19 TREASURER GOLDBERG: All righty. We're
- 20 moving on to finance and admin. And the first
- 21 item on the agenda are the proxy voting
- 22 guidelines. I'll seek a motion.
- Tony, I'm assuming you're presenting.
- MR. FALZONE: Correct.

1	TREASURER GOLDBERG: So first I'll seek
2	a motion that the PRIM Board adopt the
3	enhancements to PRIM's custom proxy voting
4	guidelines as described in the expanded agenda,
5	and further to authorize the executive director to
6	take all actions necessary to effectuate this
7	vote.
8	Is there a motion?
9	MS. McGOLDRICK: So moved.
10	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Is there a second?
11	Second anybody? Anybody?
12	MS. ROSE: Second.
13	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Thank you.
14	Go ahead.
15	MR. FALZONE: Thank you.
16	Good morning, everyone. Can everyone
17	hear me okay?
18	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes, we can.
19	MR. FALZONE: I'm Anthony Falzone,
20	PRIM's deputy executive director and chief operating
21	officer. Good morning. Representatives from ISS
22	are here to answer any questions, and the broader
23	ISS benchmark proxy voting policy is at
24	Appendix M. And their impact, or should I say no

- impact, to PRIM's custom policy for 2023 is at
- 2 Appendix N. Because those presentations cover the
- 3 benchmark policy with no impact to our custom
- 4 policy, I'm not going to be speaking to them.
- 5 They're there as informational.
- I do want to direct you to the new proxy
- 7 voting guidelines proposed by Treasurer Goldberg
- on page 22 of the expanded agenda, and these will
- 9 be added to our custom policy.
- So I guess I'll start by saying what has
- been customary, during the last meeting cycle,
- we've provided the board with these proposed
- changes so you'd have some time to look at them.
- At the same time, we also provided this language
- to ISS so they can plan potential implementation.
- These guidelines cover several areas
- such as access to reproductive healthcare, access
- to parental leave and disclosure around political
- giving and political contributions.
- I was going to run through them very
- quickly and then open it up for comments. These
- proposed guidelines are consistent with existing
- custom proxy voting guidelines that aim to
- protect employees and foster transparency.

1	So the first one is access to
2	reproductive healthcare. So we would vote for
3	shareholder proposals that require companies to
4	provide access to the full range of reproductive
5	healthcare, including but not limited to policies
6	that provide for employees that must travel to
7	access care.
8	Access to parental leave, which is we
9	would vote for shareholder proposals that require
10	companies to provide comprehensive paid parental
11	leave.
12	And then the last category is in the
13	disclosure area for political giving. So we would
14	vote for shareholder resolutions that request
15	companies to provide greater disclosure of
16	corporate campaign financing.
17	We would vote for shareholder
18	resolutions that request companies to disclose any
19	and all corporate expenditures for advertising in
20	support of or in opposition to any political
21	candidate, issue and/or ballot referendum,
22	including contributions to political candidates,
23	political action committees, $501(c)(3)$, (4) and
24	(5) organizations or any other expenditure which

- 1 may be used to influence elections.
- 2 Vote for shareholder resolutions that
- 3 call on the board to establish corporate political
- 4 giving guidelines and internal reporting
- 5 provisions or controls.
- 6 Vote against shareholder resolutions
- 7 that seek shareholder input to corporate political
- 8 giving policies or on the contributions
- 9 themselves.
- 10 And finally, vote against shareholder
- 11 resolutions seeking an advisory role on political
- 12 contributions.
- 13 So those are the proposed guidelines. I
- 14 know you were provided them last cycle, but I'll
- open it up there for comments.
- 16 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Are there any
- 17 comments from members of the board? ISS is also
- on if you have any questions for them.
- Theresa, did you want to comment on
- 20 this?
- 21 MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes. I just wanted to
- say that I'm supportive of the changes. We're
- 23 moving forward with things that we've already
- supported with our own staff here led by Treasurer

- 1 Goldberg in the past and with good practices that
- we are trying to implement, including ESG or the
- 3 new name, which escapes me now.
- 4 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Common sense.
- 5 MS. McGOLDRICK: I like that. We need
- 6 that.
- 7 And my feeling is this is just a step
- 8 forward in the right direction. The changes are
- 9 not dramatic. We're just building on what we've
- 10 already built in the previous policy with the help
- of ISS. And so I fully endorse the proposals.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Thank you.
- MR. BROUSSEAU: Madam Treasurer, just
- 14 another --
- 15 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes, Bob. Go
- 16 ahead.
- 17 MR. BROUSSEAU: I also will echo what
- 18 Theresa has said, especially one category here,
- 19 the disclosure of political giving, in light of
- 20 what the Supreme Court did many years ago that
- opened the floodgates to this kind of political
- 22 giving and influence throughout the economy and
- throughout everything we do here.
- I know it's a very conservative nature

- 1 and a conservative court, but I feel that these
- 2 additions, I think we're in the forefront, I
- 3 think, of organizations and pension funds that are
- 4 taking positions on these issues and especially
- 5 the one on political giving. I think it's crucial
- 6 that we begin to tackle this.
- 7 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I'd like to make a
- 8 few comments just addressing specifically
- 9 political giving or proxy voting guidelines
- 10 generally.
- 11 Our duty, our fiduciary duty, is to act
- on behalf of the beneficiaries and be very focused
- on returns.
- 14 Our proxy voting guidelines are really
- to help assess risks and political -- whether it's
- 16 political donations or how you treat your
- 17 employees, we believe that these are aspects of
- operating a business that can impact long-term
- 19 profitability. And that's what we're truly
- focused on.
- 21 And so that's why I reiterate, whether
- you're referring to the label, which I consider
- common sense business approaches, or these, it's
- the same thing.

1 What I can share is post *Roe*, what 2 occurred last year, in our offices, we added 3 reproductive healthcare leave for people within 4 the Treasurer's Office. So we have been finding 5 that we have to act proactively. And we feel 6 other organizations who are continuously in 7 today's world challenged by both hiring and 8 maintaining a workforce, which I believe is a huge 9 business risk, you need to be looking at things 10 that are going to help you maintain a workforce. And these are just other items to be looking at, 11 12 and I feel are fully appropriate as proxy voting 13 guidelines. 14 Are there any other --15 MR. NAUGHTON: Treasurer, if I may, I'd 16 like to comment. 17 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Go right ahead. 18 MR. NAUGHTON: Thank you. 19 First of all, I won't reiterate all of 20 the insightful things that have been said. I 21 fully agree with what Theresa said, Bob said, what 22 the Treasurer said, and so I won't go into 23 details.

24 But I think that we need to persevere

- going forward in this same vein. I think that
- 2 keynoting the point that we are concerned about
- 3 long-term investment and that these things are
- important in assuring that those will prosper is
- 5 maybe the most important thing as far as this
- 6 Board is concerned.
- And finally, I would say once again, as
- I get to do annually to my student in another
- g life, Valerie Sullivan, Valerie, so nice to see
- 10 you.
- MS. SULLIVAN: Thank you. Thank you,
- 12 Mr. Naughton. Same thing here.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay then. If
- there are no other questions or comments, I will
- proceed with the vote.
- Hearing none, Bob?
- 17 MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes.
- 18 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen?
- MS. FITCH: Yes.
- 20 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Theresa?
- 21 MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter?
- MR. MONACO: Yes.
- 24 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Dennis?

1	MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
2	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly?
3	MS. ROSE: Yes.
4	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Myself, yes.
5	The motion carries.
6	MR. FALZONE: Thank you, everyone, and
7	thank you, ISS, for being on the call.
8	Our next item is a legislative update.
9	Do you mind if I say just a few words? I want to
10	acknowledge something that was in the consent
11	agenda really, really quickly, if that's okay.
12	TREASURER GOLDBERG: Sure.
13	MR. FALZONE: I just want to
14	acknowledge Deb Coulter, chief financial officer and
15	administration officer; Qingmei Li, our director
16	of audits and financial reporting, and David
17	Gurtz, our deputy chief investment officer, and
18	many others for their work on the state audit that
19	completed in December.
20	I know the approval of that report was
21	in the consent agenda, but especially Dave was
22	very helpful as this audit was a little different
23	than our other audits, our other 30-plus audits.
24	This didn't focus on financial statements or

- 1 process and controls. This audit focused on the
- 2 PRIM Board's compliance with the investment policy
- 3 statement of investing between 5 to 10 percent of
- 4 its investments with emerging managers and whether
- 5 the PRIM Board developed a plan to ensure that not
- 6 less than 20 percent of its investment managers
- 7 are owned by minorities, women or people with
- 8 disabilities in accordance with the new investment
- 9 equity legislation.
- 10 So there were no findings of
- 11 noncompliance as a result of the state auditor's
- 12 examination. It was a very, very deep dive into
- our process and a great outcome that quite frankly
- shouldn't surprise the board with all the success
- and recognition that the FUTURE Initiative has
- 16 received and the great investment equity
- 17 legislation as a whole.
- So I just wanted to mention that,
- 19 acknowledge the team and those that kind of drive
- 20 the bus in the audit world. So thank you for the
- 21 time. Appreciate it.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: That's a perfectly
- 23 good segue.
- Now, my other question, legislative

- 1 update -- there she is.
- 2 Hi there, Emily.
- 3 MS. KOWTONIUK: Good morning still.
- 4 So we have a legislature that is back in
- 5 action. They are currently negotiating the joint
- 6 rules package right now, which will govern their
- 7 operations for this legislative session.
- 8 Just a quick flag, the joint rules as
- 9 proposed in house and senate do require public
- 10 hearings to be hybrid, or committees. So they
- 11 would require that the chairs be present and that
- there be an opportunity for both in-person and
- 13 virtual testimony.
- 14 And this is an item that we're watching
- really closely across Treasury as we have several
- 16 bodies that are subject to the Open Meeting Law.
- 17 So we're going to be watching whether there's
- 18 going to be an extension of that and what that
- 19 would look like.
- We're also waiting for committee
- 21 assignments to be made. We saw them in the senate
- yesterday. We're expecting them in the house
- today. Bills have already been filed, and they
- 24 will be referred to committees once they're stood

- 1 up.
- We did take a scan of the bills relative
- 3 to PRIM. In this session, I would say they fall
- 4 into three primary buckets.
- 5 One being divestment, which is an issue
- 6 that this board is very familiar with. There are
- 7 bills relative to divestment from nuclear weapons,
- 8 fossil fuels, guns and ammunition and Myanmar.
- 9 There's also another bucket, which I
- 10 would call sort of oversight. Representative Domb
- 11 has filed legislation creating a separate climate
- 12 review board that would act as an overlay to the
- 13 PRIM Board. And that would review the board's
- 14 investments in fossil fuels.
- And the last bucket is an operations
- 16 bucket.
- 17 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Excuse me. Who
- 18 filed that?
- 19 MS. KOWTONIUK: Representative Domb.
- 20 And this is legislation that was refiled from last
- 21 session. It didn't move last session. So we have
- an open line to her office as well, and we hope
- that they will attend the upcoming ESG committee
- 24 meeting.

- 1 So the last bucket is operations. 2 There's another ESG-related bill that's filed in 3 this bucket. So Senator Cyr filed a sustainable 4 investment bill, and this bill creates some new 5 components of fiduciary duty, including a duty to 6 a safe future, which is investing in the longer 7 time horizon. And it does also give beneficiaries 8 the right to sue the fund for noncompliance with 9 this new duty. And finally, we did see the PRIM 10 11 membership bill refiled in both the house and 12 In the house, it was filed twice this senate. 13 session by Representative Cusack and 14 Representative Peisch. And then in the senate, it 15 was filed by Senator Rush. We are expecting the governor's budget 16 17
- to come out in early March and just wanted to flag
 that the consensus revenue estimate this year is a
 little bit lower. It's a little more conservative
 at 1.6 percent growth. So we'll be watching to
 see whether there will be those supplemental
 transfers to the pension fund, but I wouldn't
 expect it, given this number.

TREASURER GOLDBERG: Thank you, Emily.

24

```
1
                Are there any questions for Emily?
2
                MR. NAUGHTON: I just have one mundane
 3
      question, Emily. Has anyone been speaking about
 4
      extending the exception to the Open Meeting Law
5
      past March 31?
                MS. KOWTONIUK: We haven't heard
 6
 7
      anything firm, and we have been asking. I know
8
      that there are some other things that are set to
9
      expire around March 31 as well, so I know this is
10
      a hot topic. We just don't have a clear answer
11
      yet.
12
                MR. NAUGHTON:
                               Thank you.
13
                MS. KOWTONIUK: Yes.
14
                TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Any other --
15
                MR. BROUSSEAU: One further question, if
16
      I may, Madam Treasurer.
17
                Maybe I could have missed it. Emily,
18
      are there any legislation that we discussed last
19
      year or you informed us of it that would alter any
20
      further the membership on the PRIM Board?
21
                TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes. She just
22
      mentioned that that's been refiled by --
23
                MR. BROUSSEAU: Okay. It's been
24
      refiled.
                I probably missed it. Okay.
```

- 1 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Yes. By Cusack and
- 2 Peisch.
- 3 MR. BROUSSEAU: Same language?
- 4 MS. KOWTONIUK: Yes.
- 5 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Thank you,
- 6 Emily.
- 7 Now, any other matters?
- 8 MR. FALZONE: I do have client service.
- 9 I don't know if the board would like to hear a
- 10 very, very brief client service update.
- 11 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Okay. Let me flip
- 12 pages here. So client services.
- MR. DANIELE: Good morning, everyone.
- 14 Can you hear me?
- 15 TREASURER GOLDBERG: I can.
- MR. DANIELE: Great. Thank you.
- 17 My name is Francesco Daniele, director
- 18 of client services.
- 19 First, I want to thank the clients that
- are participating remotely today. Thank you for
- 21 your attendance.
- The client service team is very busy as
- you would expect this time of year. Large number
- of meetings, both in-person and virtual. I'd like

- 1 to thank and acknowledge the efforts of Laura
- 2 Strickland and Emily Green.
- 3 Also the PRIM Board election process is
- 4 under way for representatives from the state
- 5 employees retirement system and the state teachers
- 6 retirement system. Ballots will be going out in
- 7 March, and we will have results by the next board
- 8 meeting in May.
- 9 That's a quick recap.
- Back to you, Tony.
- 11 MR. FALZONE: I am good.
- 12 TREASURER GOLDBERG: So that's it. Good
- job, everybody. Unless anyone --
- 14 So I am going to seek a motion to
- 15 adjourn.
- MR. BROUSSEAU: Move to adjourn.
- 17 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Is there a second?
- 18 MS. McGOLDRICK: Second.
- 19 TREASURER GOLDBERG: Roll call vote.
- 20 Bob?
- MR. BROUSSEAU: Yes.
- TREASURER GOLDBERG: Ruth Ellen?
- 23 Okay.
- 24 Theresa?

```
MS. McGOLDRICK: Yes.
1
 2
                TREASURER GOLDBERG: Peter?
 3
                 MR. MONACO: Yes.
 4
                TREASURER GOLDBERG:
                                      Dennis?
 5
                MR. NAUGHTON: Yes.
 6
                TREASURER GOLDBERG: Carly?
 7
                MS. ROSE: Yes.
8
                TREASURER GOLDBERG: Myself, yes.
9
                The motion carries.
                Thank you, everyone, for this very well-
10
11
      done meeting.
                MR. TROTSKY: Thanks, everybody.
12
13
      you soon.
               (Meeting adjourned at 11:52 a.m.)
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
```